

# The IAFOR Academic Review

Volume 1 | Issue 5

## In this edition

**Practicing Peace: The International Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice**

**Aspects of Italian Buddhist Presence and Poetry**

**Jeanette Winterson's Stone Gods as Trans-world and Trans-gender Dystopia**

**Becoming-other to Belong: Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism in Jeff Noon's Nymphomation**

**Confinement and Transgression in Eugene O'Neill's The Hairy Ape and Arthur Miller's The Crucible**

**Interdisciplinary  
Perspectives within  
Cultural Studies**

ISSN: 2188-9570



## CONTENTS

<b>1-2</b> <b>Editorial Committee</b> <b>Introduction</b> An introduction to the latest edition of The IAFOR Academic Review by Michael Liam Kedzlie	of the Ryukyus, Japan	University, Opava, Czech Republic
<b>3-7</b> <b>Practicing Peace: The International Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice</b> Samantha May, University	<b>8-12</b> <b>Aspects of Italian Buddhist Presence and Poetry</b> Roberto Bertoni, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland	<b>18-21</b> <b>Becoming-other to Belong: Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism in Jeff Noon's Nymphomation</b> Emma Nicoletti, University of Western Australia
	<b>13-17</b> <b>Jeanette Winterson's Stone Gods as Trans-world and Trans-gender Dystopia</b> Michaela Weiss, Silesian	<b>22-27</b> <b>Confinement and Transgression in Eugene O'Neill's The Hairy Ape</b>



**and Arthur Miller's *The Crucible***

Hui Chun Li, National Sun Yat-sen University, Taiwan

**28-31**

**Table of References**

**Cover Image**

*Yoga*

Image © Giuseppe Chirico

<https://www.flickr.com/photos/g-useppe/>

## The IAFOR Academic Review

Volume 1 | Issue 5

### Editorial Committee

Rev. Professor Stuart Picken – Chairman of the IAB

Dr. Joseph Haldane – IAFOR Executive Director

Mr. Michael Liam Kedzlie – IAFOR Research and Policy Manager

### The IAFOR International Academic Forum Advisory Board Conference Chairs and Cultural Studies Program Advisors

Professor Baden Offord - Director and Professor, Centre for Human Rights Education, Curtin University, Australia

Professor Koichi Iwabuchi - Director of the Monash Asia Institute, Monash University, Australia

Professor Donald E. Hall - Herbert J. and Ann L. Siegel Dean Lehigh University, USA

**IAFOR Publications © Copyright 2015**

**ISSN: 2188-9570 (online) [www.iafor.org](http://www.iafor.org)**



# Editorial Committee Introduction

One of the central missions of The International Academic Forum or IAFOR is to provide avenues for academics and researchers to explore international, intercultural and interdisciplinary approaches. One of the ways in which we do this is through our in-house magazine Eye, our various conference proceedings, our peer reviewed journals, and now beginning in 2015, our special editions of the IAFOR Academic Review.

In this, the fifth issue of the IAFOR Academic Review, we bring together a selection of the most interesting contributions from our two most recent Asian Conferences on Cultural Studies. The papers selected by the editorial committee for this special edition certainly reflect the international, intercultural and interdisciplinary approach of the forum.

**Samantha May** is a Canadian anthropologist and linguist attending the Comparative Regional Culture doctoral program at the University of the Ryukyus, Japan. Her current focus is on the revitalization of Uchinaaguchi, an Okinawan language, and its place in the Okinawan martial arts community. In her paper, *Practicing Peace: The International Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice*, May addresses how both economists and academics have noted the simultaneous tendency towards globalization and localization in recent decades. May contends that, with the increasingly globalized economy, advances in communications technology seem to bring us together only bring us close enough to recognize our fundamental differences. In this situation, internal divides along cultural, linguistic, political and economic lines become as sharp and clear as geographic boundaries used to be. In such circumstances, "peace" is often thought of as merely the absence of conflict between divergent groups. May argues that with the emergence of worldwide media we have also fueled a new ability to form globally connected communities of practice based on activities with local cultural roots. Using Wenger's (2014) community of practice theory, May examines the domain, community, practice and lexicon of the international Okinawan martial arts community through participant observation and interview and survey data, and reveals the potential role communities of practice have in facilitating transnational cooperative structures. May proposes that in this way, peace may be visualized not as a passive state of non-conflict, but as an active and creative practice based on voluntary membership in a worldwide community.

**Roberto Bertoni** is Associate Professor in Italian and Fellow at Trinity College Dublin. He has previously published on Italian post World War 2 topics, and has

translated a number of Irish authors into the Italian language. In the first, shorter section of his paper *Aspects of Italian Buddhist Presence and Poetry*, he briefly informs on how Buddhism was imported into Italy. Bertoni notes that the Italian form of Buddhism involves, about 90,000 Asian migrants, and 100,000 Italian nationals. He suggests that as a cultural borderland, Italian Buddhism, like all forms of Western Buddhism, implies an adaptation to living abroad for Eastern migrants on one hand, as well as a conversion away from Christianity to a new religious dimension, for Westerners. Becoming is also a pronounced aspect since the Buddhist spiritual itinerary is one of transformation and sharing is shown by a sense of community in the various Sanghas and lay associations. Bertoni shows that Italian Buddhism is in many cases a socially committed construct, and this also constitutes a sharing dimension. He views the 'Borderlands' in this context as being mainly re connected to the reworking of identity. The second and longer section of Bertoni's paper focuses on a particular case of border identity that can be seen among the contemporary poets inspired by Buddhism. Some of them are shown to acquire new Asian-influenced writing identities whilst others leave their Buddhist spiritually in the background of their poetics or have built inter-texts of Italian classics and Asian spiritual texts. The theoretical background of Bertoni's paper, in addition to the exploration of texts that deal with the diffusion of Buddhism in the West, is mainly on the concepts of hybridization, neo-Orientalism, and intertextuality.

**Michaela Weiss** teaches American literature and Literary Criticism at the Institute of Foreign Languages, Silesian University in Opava, Czech Republic. She works also as a translator and editor. Her research concentrates on Jewish American fiction and gender identity. In the past she has published a monograph *Jewishness as Humanism in Bernard Malamud's Fiction* (2010) and essays on both ethnic and gender identity in contemporary fiction. Weiss's paper *Jeanette Winterson's Stone Gods as Trans-world and Trans-gender Dystopia* published in this edition, analyzes the dystopian apocalyptic vision of human civilization in the novel *The Stone Gods* by the contemporary British writer Jeanette Winterson. This postmodern narrative blends the world's colonial past with its potentially colonial future, as mankind is attempts to colonize a new planet. Weiss contends that while Winterson's novel is not innovative when it comes to the formal aspects of dystopias, she manages to create a sense of fluid and omnipresent history that is constantly blended into the present, bringing into focus men's self-destructive tendencies. In her critique, Weiss points out the narrative that Winterson develops is not linear or

chronological and consists of several stories set in various times and spaces which are interconnected not only by the common theme of human greed and irresponsible economic and anti-ecological behavior, but also by the central character Billie/Billy Crusoe. Wiess outlines how Winterson in *The Stone Gods* follows the main gender-bending motif of Virginia Woolf's cult novel *Orlando*, as the character Billie chooses her partners according to their personality, not gender or biological sex. She develops the paper through the lens of the dystopian, nonlinear and often didactic tone of the novel, and how it is interwoven with poetic passages depicting homosexual romantic love, a constant theme explored by Winterson, even though in this case it concerns love between a human and a robot.

**Emma Nicoletti** is a doctoral candidate in the School of Social and Cultural Studies at the University of Western Australia, her research interests include science fiction, ecocriticism, cyberculture and poststructuralism. Her paper *Becoming-other to Belong: Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism in Jeff Noon's Nymphomation*, focuses on the science fiction novels of British author Jeff Noon, and their representation of the relationship between the human and nonhuman other in cultures dominated by virtual reality technology. Nicoletti reads Jeff Noon's *Nymphomation* as offering a model of a radical eco-cosmopolitan subjectivity that enjoins a sense of community and belonging, traversing the geographical and ideological boundaries associated with nationality, ethnicity, race, gender and species. She argues that the eco-cosmopolitan subjectivity represented in this novel requires the hero to dispense with his self-possession and self-assured independence, and instead open himself to the human and nonhuman other in a relation of interdependence, so as to be able to belong to a globally-rendered, human-changed environment. Her contention is that the process of opening oneself to the other as transformative for the individual, the society and the environment.

**Hui-Chun Li** from the Department of Foreign Languages and Literature, at the National Sun-Yat Sen University in Kaohsiung, Taiwan researches within the academic space of cultural and literary studies with respect to the post-human, Cyberspace, Utopian Imagination, and postmodernism. In her paper *Confinement and Transgression in Eugene O'Neill's The Hairy Ape and Arthur Miller's The Crucible*, Ms Li considers that society is an institution which, in order to achieve its goal, executes violent measures to discipline or confine the deviant. This collision between self and society is depicted in Eugene O'Neill's *The Hairy Ape* and Arthur Miller's *The Crucible* in which John Proctor and Yank, each of the play's protagonists, is defiant respectively to theocracy and capitalism. Li's paper aims to situate both Yank and Proctor as cultural products manufactured by utopian desires, respectively under

cultural conditions of an Industrial society and Salem's theocracy. In it she adopts Michel Foucault's concept of utopia and heterotopia to look at Yank's transgression and his critical position in criticizing the bourgeois society. Li argues that the commercialized bourgeois space is a realized utopia whereas the cage on the ship, the prison, and the zoo are heterotopias, which serve as a critique to the degenerated utopian society itself. She suggests that while Yank exchanges his life for a noble protest against a state of inertia manufactured by capitalism, Proctor exchanges his life for others' lives imperiled by theocracy. Li filters this through the light of Foucauldian rarefaction of discourse, and analyzes how Salem's theocracy silences Proctor's discourse through judicial inquisition and exclusion of the deviated. She reveals that, as much as Yank's subversion to a capitalist space incessantly silences his voice, Proctor's defiance to court's order and God's will transgresses the totality of theocracy and strives to give a voice to truth.

Finally the editorial committee of the IAFOR International Academic Review would like to thank our conference chairs and advisors Professors Baden Offord, Koichi Iwabuchi and Donald E. Hall for their continual guidance with our Cultural Studies conference program and publications. We also would like to thank the many delegates who attended our conferences and who submitted academic papers to our previous proceedings.

**Michael Liam Kedzlie**

Editorial Committee  
The IAFOR Academic Review

# Practicing Peace: The International Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice

SAMANTHA MAY, UNIVERSITY OF THE RYUKYUS, JAPAN

## Introduction: Cleaving Together and Cleaving Apart

Those from the diverse fields of language maintenance to business have noted simultaneous tendencies towards both globalization and localization. Our use of computers and the internet has resulted in an extremely powerful mass communications ability, unprecedented in all of human history. However, this ability to connect to anyone, anywhere, often seems to bring us only close enough together to like each other less; geographical barriers have been supplanted by often deeper cultural, linguistic, economic and political divides. The expansion in the membership and influence of multinational political and apolitical bodies such as the European Union and the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) has also come with the recognition of such meaningful differences. The United Nations took the occasion of its' 50th anniversary to "[c]ontinue to reaffirm the right of self-determination of all peoples" (1995), which has led to subsequent political changes. The former Yugoslavia, for example, is now six separate countries, but it is uncertain whether we should say it has "expanded" or "split" along pre-existing self-determined divides.

This begs the question of where constructive divides begin and end. Culturally and linguistically, Okinawa is certainly different from Japan, but Miyako Island is different from the rest of Okinawa. However, even within Miyako, there is no guarantee that two people from opposite sides of the island will share a common culture or mutually intelligible language besides that of Japanese. Sharing a distinct culture, language, and ancestry may foster group identity, but also has the potential to strengthen already existing boundaries between Self and Other. The word "cleave", meaning both "to cleave together" and "to cleave apart", may best describe these current trends.

## Self-Determination and the Definition of Peace

With regards to self-determination, minority language rights are a particularly sensitive issue. Rita Izsák, an independent expert for the UN on minority issues, argues that "[l]anguage is a central element and expression of identity and of key importance in the preservation of group identity" and that "[l]anguage is particularly important to linguistic minority communities seeking to maintain their distinct group and cultural identity, sometimes under conditions of marginalization, exclusion and discrimination" (United Nations, 2013). While she acknowledged that language rights

are often construed as part of secessionist movements that threaten governmental authority and national unity, states have often in turn "aggressively promoted a single national language as a means of reinforcing sovereignty, national unity and territorial integrity" (United Nations, 2013) Most critically, "Ms. Izsák...noted that protection of linguistic minority rights is a human rights obligation and an essential component of good governance, efforts to prevent tensions and conflict, and the construction of equal and politically and socially stable societies." This leads to another important question: If the promotion of minority languages as an aspect of self-determination is essential to conflict prevention and the promotion of peace between groups, what is the definition of peace?

Although peace may be defined as the absence of war, most current peace scholars and activists argue that this definition is inadequate. Höglund & Söderberg (2010) assert "merely looking at the frequency of peace agreements that lead to the ending of large-scale violence does not tell us much about the reality of peace beyond the absence of war...[P]eace is a term that encompasses a whole range of meanings and has highly subjective connotations" (p. 367-368, 370). In a post on Share the World's Resources' website Shirin Ibadi (2007) of Open Democracy cites the number of deaths that occur in developing countries, particularly among children, due to malnutrition, inadequate health care, and poor sanitation. He writes "[p]eace means serenity. One can only feel serene if one's human rights are not violated and one's integrity is protected" (Share the World's Resources website). Goetze & Bliesemann de Guevara (2014) observe that "[c]osmopolitanism has been frequently put forward as the political ideology that should underpin peacebuilding missions... [because of] the connection that is made between the tolerance and universalism of cosmopolitanism on the one hand, and the idea of peace as reconciliation and justice in war-torn societies on the other" (p. 1-2). Given UNESCO's support of linguistic and cultural rights and freedoms, peace could be defined as the freedom of individuals and groups to have and maintain their own self-determined practices without threat of personal harm. Thus, instead of being a passive state describing the absence of negative conflict, we can arrive at a definition of peace as an active and dynamic practice.

## Peace as a Practice

What does the practice of peace look like? The answer came to my attention before the question, and from an unlikely source. While searching for terrible music on youtube.com, I saw what looked to be a very promising video of a girl singing Ozzy Osbourne's "Crazy Train." However, watching the video made

plain that not only was the girl extremely talented, but the equally talented musicians who accompanied her were each from a different country, collectively representing USA, Japan, Mexico and Spain (Sabrina Carpenter, 6:24-6:40). We can imagine how these people overcame vast geographic, cultural, and linguistic distances in the production of this music video. Certainly, this accomplishment would not have been possible, or at least would have been much more difficult, without peace between these countries. Watching the music video produced by people working together across numerous distances, I had a sudden realization: this was what peace looked like. My question became: If many areas and peoples around the world have achieved relative peace, what can we now do together?

## Communities of Practice

Of course, we may hope for Big Answers, such as ending poverty, disease and war (and we are working on them), but before we can get to those, let's first look at the smaller answers. In other words, what kinds of transnational, transcultural and translinguistic cooperative activities are already happening, and how do they function?

Working with others at a company, going to school, making a youtube video, or pursuing a favourite pass time are all activities where people engage with one another for a specific purpose in their daily lives. In his article "Communities of Practice and Social Learning Systems" (2000), Etienne Wenger outlines a "social definition of learning" in which "[l]earning...is an interplay between social competence and personal experience. It is a dynamic, two-way relationship between people and the social learning systems in which they participate. It combines personal relationships with the evolution of social structures"(p. 227). Wenger focuses on "communities of practice" as "the basic building blocks of a social learning system because they are the social 'containers' of the competences that make up that system. By participating in these communities, we define with each other what constitutes competence in a given context: being a reliable doctor, a gifted photographer, a popular student, or an astute poker player"(p. 229).

Communities of practice are composed of three elements: 1) mutuality or a community that encompasses the various interactions between community members, 2) a joint enterprise or practice that represents how a community strives to achieve its' goals, and 3) a shared repertoire or domain that defines the community's area of expertise, including "language, routines, sensibilities, artifacts, tools, stories, styles etc." (p. 229) as well as access to these resources, and the ability to use them appropriately. "Communities of practice grow out of a convergent interplay of competence and experience that involves mutual engagement. They offer an opportunity to negotiate competence through an experience of direct participation. As a consequence, they remain important social units of learning even in the context of much larger systems" (p. 229, emphasis added).

Because communities of practice are social learning systems structured around social competence and personal experience resulting from direct participation, they do not define belonging according to geopolitical boundaries, but in terms of three modes of belonging to a community. "Engagement" is the ability to engage or accomplish things with others in the

community. "Imagination" is the ability to abstractly envision the placement of oneself and others in the community as well as future possibilities. "Alignment" refers to bringing local or individual practice in line with those of the larger community to assist in the achievement of mutual aims. Thus, using these modes of belonging, people voluntarily form peaceful communities across geographical, social, cultural and linguistic boundaries in order to successfully improve joint practices. It is the potential of communities of practice to draw people together that has great relevance for peacemaking, and it is this, which is the focus of this paper.

## The Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice

### a. Community: Structure and Identity

The international Okinawan martial arts community is a fascinating community of practice made up of karate and kobudo practitioners. This group shares a community, domain, and practice. The Okinawan martial arts community includes approximately 50 million members in over 150 countries worldwide (Okinawa Prefecture, 2014). The Okinawan martial arts community can be said to be a "trans" community in that it is transcultural, transnational, and translinguistic, uniting its' members across many often problematic barriers. However, unlike other communities of practice, because Okinawan martial arts are deeply connected to Okinawan culture and the majority of the martial arts community is not Okinawan, frequent "border crossings" are necessary to the practice of the Okinawan martial arts community. This largely entails the alignment of non-Okinawan students with their Okinawan instructors and their Okinawan students. The Okinawan martial arts community is heavily dependent on positive interpersonal relations. Because it is a knowledge-based community, it relies on face-to-face communication for improvements in practice. Therefore, knowing and maintaining good relations, particularly with high-level instructors in the community, is essential, and this cannot be done if cultural, national, or linguistic barriers are allowed to stand in the way.

Marking the martial arts community as a quintessential community of practice (Wenger, 2000), the emphasis in martial arts practice is on learning, rather than achievement. Although there is an extremely strong hierarchy within the martial arts community, it is based on individual skill and length of membership in the community; it is inclusive rather than competitive. For example, the rank of nanadan, or seventh degree black belt, is very difficult to achieve, but there are no limits on the number of nanadans in the world and the rank is open to anyone who meets the criteria. Thus, traditional hierarchies are broken apart as martial arts membership supersedes the importance of sex, race, class, and general social standing outside the dojo. Although the highest status Okinawan karate and kobudo practitioners tend to be elder Okinawan males, it would be expected, for example, that a young African woman would give commands to an older Japanese male in the dojo if she were his senior student. It is furthermore significant that, unlike membership in a sex or race-based group, membership in the Okinawan martial arts community is voluntary. Therefore, if a martial artist does not

like his or her position in the hierarchy, he or she may simply change schools or opt out of the community entirely, which is seldom an option for race, sex, or class-based discrimination.

## b. Domain, Lexicon, and Symbols

The domain of Okinawan martial arts includes knowledge of Okinawan culture, language, and symbols in addition to knowledge of martial arts techniques. Because it is the birthplace of karate and kobudo, information about Okinawa is not only explicitly taught, but implicitly learned through the practice of Okinawan martial arts and highly valued. Movement forms do not spontaneously occur, but are culturally embedded. For example, many martial arts techniques bear a great physical resemblance to movements of Okinawan dance (Juster, 2011). However, the similarities between martial arts and other Okinawan art forms only become apparent after familiarity with both arts. The understanding of Okinawan martial arts, including forms of address, etiquette and so on in addition to the interpretation of movements, is therefore incomplete outside of an Okinawan cultural context. Thus, martial arts tourism to and from Okinawa is highly desirable by members of the community because it helps facilitate a more complete understanding of the cultural context in which karate and kobudo occur (May, 2012).

Like the members of other communities of practice, the martial arts community also has a shared lexicon comprised of Japanese terms for counting, techniques, and dojo etiquette, mixed with the local language of the practitioners, and often some Uchinaaguchi, or Okinawan language, terms. It is frequently the case that all the members of a multinational karate group have only martial arts-related Japanese or Uchinaaguchi words as their sole common language, but as this lexicon also includes some basic vocabulary such as “sensei”, “sumimasen”, “arigatougozaimasu” and the numbers one to ten, as well as some kanji, there is certainly enough language in common to conduct a class together. However, in order to further improve their technique, many foreign martial arts students wish to learn Japanese, and occasionally Uchinaaguchi, so they can receive detailed instruction directly from their Okinawan instructors.

In addition to verbal and written language, the Okinawan martial arts community has a shared set of symbols related to their practice. For example, there are several karate and kobudo styles, and within each style there are several schools, which are each represented by a crest that is usually sewn or embroidered onto the karate uniform, over the heart. Dojo in different countries might be affiliated with a particular dojo or organization in Okinawa, with some Okinawan dojo having over 200 branch dojo abroad (International Okinawa Goju-Ryu Karate-Do Federation, 2014). In this case, there are often similarities between the crests, where the same image or kanji is used with different text representing a particular location. In this way, members affiliated with the same honbu, or main, dojo in Okinawa can instantly recognize one another, which is particularly useful for organizational or social purposes at large international events.

## c. Practice

The practice of the martial arts community has physical, mental, spiritual, and cultural components. Most martial arts practice takes place within a private group class, but may also occur in public for a demonstration, seminar, or tournament. The physical practice of Okinawan karate and kobudo, which differ from dojo to dojo, may include kata, or forms, basic blocking and striking techniques, the use of weapons, kumite, or sparring, wrestling techniques, joint locks and so on, performed singularly or with one or more partners. Though the physical component may form the bulk of the class, it is usually framed within formal meditation practice at the beginning and end of each class, and is structured with the regular usage of Japanese terms that mark the different techniques practised in each phase of the class, such as “kon tiki tai”, “renzokumite” and so on. The use of formal Japanese, such as “arigatou gozaimashita” and “onegaishimasu”, as well as frequent bowing and standing at attention facilitate a sense of discipline and mental focus. Often cultural information about Okinawa or explanations of the meaning of particular techniques or dojo symbols is introduced throughout the class, or before the final formal “bow out” at class end. Because karate and kobudo techniques include meditation and learning about martial arts as well as the physical practice of techniques, martial arts may be practised individually at home as well as in a dojo.

Still, if martial arts techniques are designed to kill or disable an opponent, even if this is being done in a structured environment within the context of an international community of practice, one might wonder how the practice of martial arts can lead to peace. To answer this question, it is necessary to understand the intended goals of martial arts practice. Mastery of the physical techniques might first appear to be the most difficult goal to accomplish, but in order for this to happen, instructors from many different countries must first train together in Okinawa, and this is not always easy. In the words of one Okinawan instructor “[s]ometimes foreign instructors don’t get along” (A. Yagi, personal communication, January 26, 2014), which leads to frequent situations where people with deadly combat skills, who may dislike each other intensely and cannot speak the same language, must physically interact with one another. Fortunately, the various karate and kobudo practitioners in the martial arts community ultimately must find a way to cooperate because it is the only way to improve their technique. Thus, the most important goal of martial arts practice, as stated by both Okinawan and overseas instructors, is not in fact mastery of the techniques, but self-control. In other words, members of the martial arts community are not practising violence, but rather how to be peaceful in potentially volatile situations; this is the essence of serenity found in Ibadi’s (2007) definition of peace.

## How Do Martial Arts Promote Peace?

In addition to the international friendships that are formed through regular interactions between members of the martial arts community, several studies demonstrate that martial arts encourage peaceful behaviour. For example, Troyer (2011) correlated martial arts practice with the concept of mindfulness. Mindfulness is “positively related to an individual’s ability to sustain attention, focus, and regulate negative emotions...[and] is necessary for higher or more effective LOC [Level of Consciousness] or the degree of



responsiveness to the stimuli in the environment” (p. 291). Troyer further notes that training in self-awareness and LOC would encourage students to “better solve difficult problems by revealing to them the part they play in the problem solving process” allowing them to “potentially catch mistakes quicker, change strategies for quicker and more accurate analysis, avoid using up valuable working memory space with unnecessary stress or worry, and overall process information more efficiently and accurately” (p. 293). The benefits of mindfulness and enhanced LOC would be extremely useful in the peace-building process.

Trulson (1986) and Twemlow and Sacco (1998) observed that martial arts practice was connected with a decrease in bullying and delinquent behaviour among adolescents with a history of violence. In “The application of traditional martial arts practice and theory to the treatment of violent adolescents”, Twemlow and Sacco illustrated how violent adolescents, often with a history of criminal activity and gang involvement, greatly benefited from a therapeutic martial arts program, writing that “[t]he training strongly supports synthetic ego functions, particularly control of aggressive impulses. It may be especially helpful in assisting verbally limited students in mastering leadership skills,” (Conclusion section, para. 1) which may assist with non-violent problem solving. They concluded, that “martial arts taught in a traditional way also offer an organizing framework for understanding the world and a sense of historical connectedness, helping violent adolescents overcome their dysfunctional circumstances” (Conclusion section, para. 2). Lakes and Hoyt (2004) also demonstrated a connection between martial arts participation and increased self-regulation, and Nosanchuk’s (1981) study on traditional martial arts practice and aggressiveness showed an overall decrease in aggression among long-term martial arts practitioners.

Supporting the idea of social acceptance being broadly found within the martial arts community, Rao (2008) conducted a study of a karate dojo that included children with physical and mental disabilities in regular classes. He writes, “[w]hile the literature on inclusive strategies has continued to burgeon and inform our focused efforts in creating inclusive schools and communities, we are also learning more about how some communities as well as settings come to so naturally ‘accept’ or ‘include’ people who are different” (p. 294). Ultimately, Rao attributes the inclusiveness of the students in the dojo to the main instructor, who questioned “the existence of the dual categories of ability and disability [and saw] his students as more complex human beings. The ways, in which such a perspective shapes his pedagogy, his interaction with students as well as the community that he creates within his school is profound” (p. 295). Though it was not the focus of his study, Rao acknowledged the possibility that the instructor’s practices “may have also been fostered by his interpretation of the martial arts tradition of karate” (p. 296).

The literature shows a correlation between martial arts practice and increases in mindfulness and self-regulation, with decreases in aggression and violent behaviour, as well as the ability to foster inclusive communities. It is likely that these benefits result from the current practices of the international Okinawan martial arts community as well, and certainly they contribute to the practice of peace.

## **Boundaries and Borderlands in Okinawan Martial Arts**

The Okinawan martial arts community is a large international group practising control of violence. As karate and kobudo are designated as intangible cultural properties of Okinawa and Japan, this community is Okinawa-centred even though the majority of its members are not Okinawan themselves. Therefore, not only must practitioners of Okinawan martial arts frequently cooperate across cultural, linguistic, and personal borders, but also they must accept and respect the Okinawan Other as the pre-eminent authority within their community. However, rather than viewing the Other’s culture from an abstract distance, members of this community are, albeit to a limited extent, involved in the Other’s cultural practices.

Wenger (2000) wrote that a social learning situation “combines personal relationships with the evolution of social structures” (p. 227). The Okinawan martial arts community is a prime example of a social structure that evolved out of personal relationships, but it is the ongoing process of cross-cultural alignment, whereby martial artists around the world strive to make their practice as close as possible to that of their Okinawan counterparts, that makes this community particularly worthy of study as a model of peaceful international relations. As a small kingdom which relied on international trade for hundreds of years, Okinawa itself has a long history as a peaceful “bankoku no kuni” or “bridge to all nations”, and several scholars have agreed that this peaceful image reaches beyond the realm of myth to shape a possible future for Japanese international relations. Hein (2001) writes that Okinawans may “spearhead a national policy that translates the strong pacifist sentiments of the Japanese population into an active principle for international engagement” (p. 35, as quoted in Govreen, 2014). Whether or not the Okinawan martial arts community derives its’ capacity for peace from its’ Okinawan cultural roots, the same desire for non-violence and peaceful engagement with the international community underpins the martial arts community, blurring the boundaries between Okinawan and Other within community practice.

## **Problems in the Martial Arts Community**

Despite its’ potential to greatly contribute to peace, the Okinawan martial arts community is not without problems. Firstly, it is a very diverse community, incorporating many different styles of karate and kobudo. Consequently, participants’ different nationalities are often less of an issue than the lack of cooperation and disunity between styles, or even within the same style. Though part of martial arts practice is self-improvement, martial skill may not always be equated with personal merit.

Thus, the interpersonal politics between teachers, even those within the same school who operate different individual dojo, can be extremely complicated and problematic. Furthermore, although some individual karate or kobudo classes may have 50% or more female participants, the very few female Okinawan instructors who exist are rarely publicly recognized. This may contribute to sexism within the community. Some foreign female practitioners have reported foreign male

students' refusal to interact with them; interestingly, Okinawan male instructors were not reported to be sexist.

The martial arts community abroad is largely a young community that grew significantly during the 1980s. It may not sustain itself forever, especially given the fact that there are a limited number of Okinawan teachers to go around for a very large community of 50,000,000 students. It is possible that the Okinawan instructors will not be able to keep up with their worldwide following, and all the personal travel this necessitates. Furthermore, although Okinawan martial arts are one of many cultural arts in Okinawa that all have connections to Okinawan history, language, and lifeways, the overseas martial arts community may hyperfocus on their practice. Without a complete picture of the Okinawan cultural context of the martial arts, foreign martial arts practitioners may be prone to misinterpretation of cultural cues, leading to over-politeness and miscommunication.

Finally, in some cases martial arts participation may arise out not out of genuine interest and a desire for self-improvement, but from the fetishization of Japanese and Okinawan culture (Said, 1978). This has led to the commodification of Okinawan martial arts as some instructors seek to take advantage of students' desires to "buy in" to their image of this community (Brown & Leledaki, 2010).

## **Applications of the Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice**

Peace is often associated with cosmopolitanism, including the preservation of local cultural diversity. The hierarchical structure of the Okinawan martial arts community, and its' alignment with Okinawan culture make it an ideal community in which to promote Okinawan cultural interests. Since Uchinaaguchi, an indigenous Okinawan language, is endangered within Okinawa and many karate and kobudo instructors wish to revive it, the Okinawan martial arts community may be highly receptive to using it in their practice. As predicted by Wenger's concept of alignment within communities of practice, interviews with both overseas and Okinawan members of the Okinawan martial arts community revealed strikingly similar attitudes towards Okinawan language preservation:

"I really want to keep the Okinawan connection alive and...as the art of Okinawa is Goju Ryu, then the language goes with that..[It] brings us a little closer to keeping this art alive and helping to promote the Okinawan culture as well,

[to] promote this language." (L. Marchant, personal communication, October 16, 2013)

"If Uchinaguchi is lost, Okinawan culture will also be lost...So let's use Okinawan dialect...let's start teaching Okinawan dialect to children...'If you don't understand your country's language, you will forget your country.'"

(Okinawan martial artist, personal communication, February 20, 2013)

Preliminary results from a survey of the international martial arts community triangulate these findings. The average ratings on a ten-point Lichert scale for "learning about Okinawan culture is beneficial for martial arts practice" were 9.48, and for "learning about Okinawan language is beneficial for martial arts practice," the average was 7.48. Thus, it appears that the martial arts community as a whole has a stake in the promotion and maintenance of Okinawan culture and language, especially as it is connected to their practice.

## **Conclusion**

Paralleling the trends among international political and non-governmental agencies, the tendency in communities of practice is also towards greater transnational cooperation, as already exists within the international Okinawan martial arts community. That a transnational community so skilled in inflicting damage on others can so successfully cooperate and mobilize on such a massive scale should give hope for other activity-based collaborations.

The conception of peace as a practice in which something is produced or learned may directly assist the international peace building process using indirect or oblique methods. Much like an immersion approach to second language acquisition, the Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) methodology (Dalton-Puffer, Nikula & Smit, 2010) involves using the target language to learn another subject, rather than studying the language directly. If this idea is applied to peace building through communities of practice, peaceful relations are not the stated goal, but a by-product of other forms of border-crossing, co-constructive learning practices. Thus, peace is not the absence of war, but the learned successful negotiation of interpersonal conflict in potentially volatile circumstances. As in the Okinawan martial arts community, peace may be found in the palpable presence of joint creative activities that enrich human existence and our shared environment.

**Full references can be found in the Table of References section.**

# Aspects of Italian Buddhist Presence and Poetry

ROBERTO BERTONI  
TRINITY COLLEGE DUBLIN, IRELAND

## Introduction

The theoretical background of this paper, in addition to texts on the diffusion of Buddhism in the West (Batchelor, Baumann and Prebish, Harvey, MacMahan), confronts the Asian Conference on Cultural Studies's theme of sharing through the concepts of hybridization (Kraidy), neo-Orientalism (Said), and intertextuality (Bloom). The first section of the paper will briefly inform on how Buddhism was imported to Italy (Bertoni, Pasqualotto, Stortini) – the theme of becoming is implicit here in the practice of conversion. The second section will touch on belonging under the guise of the new spiritual and cultural identities that can be seen among contemporary poets inspired by Buddhism (Candiani, Carifi, Niccolai). In general, Buddhism in a Western country like Italy can be seen as a borderland, since it takes place against a cultural background that included this vision of the world only very marginally until recently, as it will be briefly hinted below. Let us start with some considerations on Buddhism in relation to hybridization and neo-Orientalism.



Photo by Gustavo Farraon (Creative Commons)

## 2. Buddhism as an Oriental import

The presence of Buddhism in Italy dates back to Marco Polo's time, and onward to Matteo Ricci and other missionaries who commented upon Buddhism partly in favorable but mostly in unfavourable ways. Some more detailed and sympathetic commentaries were written in the 19th century, when the first properly Orientalist studies were published in Italy (Pasqualotto). In the 20th century, a number of scholars wrote about Buddhism in informed ways and within the context of a scientific view on East Asia - namely Tucci who explored Tibetan culture in depth, and Maraini, originally his pupil, who lived for a time in Japan. The latest and most prolific import of Buddhism into Italy, however, has taken place in the last five decades. Buddhism in Italy presently appears to involve about 89,000 Asian migrants, and 100,000 Italian nationals (Stortini). Some comments follow below on this recent phenomenon.

An aspect of cultural borderland, and partly also hybridization, is that Italian Buddhism, like all Western Buddhism, implies adaptation to living abroad for Eastern Asian migrants; and conversion from Christianity, or at any rate to a new religious dimension, for Westerners.

There are actual differences in religious mentality and loyalty to traditions as expressed by practitioners from countries where Buddhism is an official religion, and by newly converted Italians who hybridize the Dharma teachings to a higher extent with Western philosophies.

On the one hand, to cite a statement by Weber (1918, p. 139), in modernity "the world is disenchanted. One needs no longer have recourse to magical means in order to master or implore the spirits". By contrast to this well-established interpretation of modernity, Beck maintains that it has become apparent that the pairing of modernization and secularization is not as accurate as it seemed to be only a few years ago. This is due a process of "re-enchantment" that consists in the appearance in the West of new types of spirituality, i.e. of social and personal systems of feeling and thought other than Christianity. Such an interpretation is rather interesting in general, and perhaps newly converted Buddhists are indeed motivated, in Italy like elsewhere in Europe, by a need for a re-enchantment of the world. Yet, one

wonders to what extent this hypothesis is fully tenable, given the need for an uprooting of delusionary visions of reality and a confrontation with the sheer fact of suffering as a starting point in meditation on the Four Noble Truths.

On the other hand, with its insistence on impermanence, and because it is a non-theist religion, Buddhism appears to respond, once again in terms of borderland hybridization with Western theories, to the rather secular need to come to terms with modern temporariness and flexibility in liquid modernity (Bauman), and with a non-strictly religious need for spirituality. In the last thirty years, some of the interest in Buddhism has been caused by its capability of “communicating with a post-industrial modern society” (Obadia, p. 19). Buddhist persuasions would appear to coincide, at least in some respects, with anti-materialism and rejection of consumerism by social groups and individuals, while also responding to the need for happiness expressed by Western late-modern ideologies. In brief, Buddhism would seem to combine social “well-being” and “spirituality” (Obadia, p. 93).

Some scholars go as far as to doubt that Western Buddhism is motivated by typically religious needs, and they maintain that at its roots we find an undefined quest for spirituality:

“It might as well be that the attraction of Buddhism in the eyes of Westerners is rather a push towards spirituality than a way back to religiousness, and this Buddhist-like type of spirituality offers a credible response to the anxiety created by the modern world. This idealized and purely spiritual variety of Buddhism is what I call ‘neo-Buddhism’ as distinct from other types of Buddhism which have kept contact with tradition, in the bad and the good, in Asia” (Faure, p. 113).

This may be seen either as a fact, or merely an opinion, however what one can say is that Buddhism is a religion but in the West a number of sympathisers emphasize the moral rather than metaphysical teachings. Even the Dalai Lama does not seem to exclude this possibility when he explains that a life based on ethical principles is not necessarily founded on religious convictions: “I have come to the conclusion that whether or not a person is religious does not matter much. Far more important is that they be a good human being” (Gyatso 1999, p. 20).

One aspect of Buddhist moral behaviour that is compatible with Western mentality is a practical attitude, based on the persuasion of usefulness of certain acts. Goodness, in brief, is not only morally and psychologically rewarding, but also useful, and acting well is beneficial because it creates well-being by making one feel at harmony with the universe.

The ideological context, in particular for Italian converts, is connected to the reworking of identity in terms of neo-

Orientalism. A revival of Eastern religions took place in Europe, the US and other Western countries in the 1960s and 1970s in connection with liberation ideologies, the hippy movement, and other anti-institutional philosophies. Hinduism, yoga, Buddhism, among other religions, were adopted by admirers of Asia who idealized ahimsa by presuming peacefulness existed in countries that in reality were not too rarely pervaded in those decades by social conflict and violent political strife. Asia, in line with Said’s concept of Orientalism, at times provided a supposedly exotic framework of reference to Italians. Marginal communities and individuals additionally adopted Asian religions as an attitude of protest, in opposition to a Christianity that seemed to have links to vested power and tradition.

Some Western interpretations see Buddhism as more tolerant than Christianity. Discussion has taken place, for example, on the Buddhist concept of error, or blindness, as different from the Christian concept of sin (Kornfield). This obviously applies to Italy, too, since the hegemonic religion there is Catholicism.

Beck has also identified the search for a “personal God” that for a number of Western people would seem to have replaced collective formal representations of Christianity. An embryo of rediscovery of Buddhism took shape and continued to develop in Italy in the 1980s and 1990s in connection with new types of spirituality such as the Aquarian Age and the New Age accompanied by imaginative and not explicitly political traits. In the 21st century, though, Buddhism in Italy, as well as more in general in Europe, took distance from these practices and developed in independent and more conventional ways as it kept growing in numbers.

In short, in a number of cases, the West has developed modes of approaching and importing Buddhism that are not only suitable for religiously oriented people but for secular mentalities influenced by the Enlightenment.

Nonetheless, Buddhism and Catholicism in some measure share aspects on a borderland. For instance, there are similarities and common features between Buddhism and Catholic monasticism with regard to the configuration of communities of the practising religious and the need for meditation. The Dalai Lama (Gyatso 2012) states: “Christians are very close to the Buddhist spirituality. I am thinking, for instance, of Christian monastic life where attention and time are devoted to meditation”. We can find further connections between the evangelical concepts of charity and altruism, and the Mahayana tradition of the Bodhisattva.

Concerning re-working of identity from a more politically oriented perspective, after the wavering of neo-Marxist utopias in the 1980s, Buddhism was one of the ways to provide some Italian radicals with a forward-

looking vision of the world, based on a consideration of human beings as unhappy, and yet on an ability to progress towards a socially positive dimension.

In this respect, in the 1980s and 1990s, Buddhism configured itself in Italy as a predominantly socially aware approach, and Buddhist organizations have increasingly become involved with ecological issues, peace movements, protection of human rights at home and abroad, as well as with specific Asian issues such as the Tibetan diaspora.

Sharing, in the above context, is therefore shown by social participation, while a sense of community is also noticeable both in Buddhist sanghas and secular associations, with varying accentuations of theory and practice depending on the particular schools chosen – Tibetan and Zen schools, but also other Mahayana traditions and Theravada teachings. These were either imported from Asia, or they were now and then introduced into Italy via European monasteries. A particular case is that of Soka Gakkai, originally from Japan, inspired by Nichiren Daishonin's teachings, but developed autonomously on the peninsula in Italy in the last decades.

Individual becoming is relevant, since a Buddhist spiritual itinerary is one of personal transformation of negativities into positive attitudes (selfishness into altruism, and so on). On this level, interconnections, mutual borrowings and shared views are visible between Buddhism and psychology. In Italy, like in other Western countries, a number of psychologists use the Buddhist meditational practice of mindfulness in depression therapy. Italian analytical psychologists inspired by Jung adopt symbols such as the mandala and other Buddhist notions within the therapeutic framework of the process of individuation, on the ground that both Jung and Buddhism aim at the transformation and rebirth of the individual (Moacanin, 1986). Bonecchi maintains that non-Buddhist therapy is probably preferable to meditation in order to deal with psychosis, but Buddhist awareness of suffering, due to disease, getting old and disappointments of all kinds, are useful in the treatment of neurosis.

### 3. Italian contemporary Buddhist poets

The second section of this paper focuses on a particular case of borderland identity that can be seen among contemporary poets inspired by Buddhism.

One premise here is that, in relation to mentality studies (Sorokin), whereas in Asian countries Buddhism permeates the attitudes and reflections of people consciously and unconsciously since it has shaped those civilizations, in Italy it is a relatively recent acquisition and it influences writers in more oblique and perhaps superficial ways due to their more limited knowledge of

this religion. The mentality of Italian poets, willingly or unwillingly, and by acceptance as well as rejection, is receptive of several nuances of Christian philosophy. Nevertheless, it is more of a *tabula rasa* (or colloquially a clean slate) towards Buddhism, the principles and ideas of which have penetrated literary culture gradually and often incompletely for reasons of non-traditional belonging of Italians in this vision of the world.

Yet, philosophical concerns are frequent among Italian Buddhist poets. A question is also posed on how a neophyte can propagate his new beliefs. On this plan, some neo-Buddhist writers exhibit the intellectual freshness of newly received ideas.

With reference to intertextuality, understood here as an aspect of cultural borderland sharing, some of the Italian Buddhist poets have acquired new Asian-influenced writing identities, and in this field the haiku is particularly conspicuous with cross-reference to classics such as Basho but also to more modern Japanese verse. Buddhist poetry from a number of other Asian traditions has been translated into Italian and has influenced local writers – just to mention two illustrious intellectuals, 11th/12th-century Milarepa from Tibet and 20th/21st-century Ko Un from Korea.

Certain Italian poets leave Buddhist spirituality mostly in the background as an additional aspect of their poetics, as is the case with Candiani. Intertexts have been built from Italian classics and Asian spiritual texts, as it occurs with Carifi who reads the Tibetan Bardo Thodol (Liberation through Hearing during the Intermediate State) through the linguistic mediation of Dante Alighieri's *Inferno*. Others have moved from a previous variety of secular poetics to a different one based on spiritual themes, as Niccolai did. More details on some of the works of the three authors just mentioned will be given below, accompanied by the present writer's translations of the poets' statements and texts from Italian into English.

Chandra Livia Candiani (born in 1952) practices Theravada Buddhism, teaches Vipassana meditation, translates Buddhist texts, and writes poetry. Her identity as a resident in Italy with Russian ancestry, and a user of different languages, belongs in a borderland accentuated by her cross-reference to Western and Eastern intellectual persuasions.

She stopped writing for some periods when Vipassana meditation seemed in conflict with the act of producing literary scripts, and at those times it was "important to understand what counted most in my life" (Candiani 2014, 2), yet poetry always re-emerged, and in fact her process of growth in Buddhism helped to also renew her poetical language and ideas.

Even though she states that Buddhism does not explicitly pervade her poems, “or else my poetry would be strictly ideological”, this religion is clearly her predominant view of the world even though what she seeks for is essentially “human qualities” (Candiani 2014, 2). With regard to solidarity, she expresses a concept of mutual charity that seems somehow shared with Christianity (Candiani 2014, 1, p. 11):

“The universe has no centre,  
But humans, in order to embrace, act as follows:  
They approach one another slowly  
And yet without any apparent reason,  
Afterwards they open arms,  
Show the disarmament of wings,  
They finally disappear  
Together  
In the space of charity  
Between one  
And the other”.

Buddhism and poetry interact in her view of the latter as nothingness (Candiani, 2005, p. 81):

“In the light bones  
The vacuum is written,  
In the immature voice  
An unattained life is written,  
Due neither to premature death  
Nor to laziness or cowardice  
But to devotion to the nothingness  
Of poetry”.

The most evident aspect of a direct influence of Buddhism on her poetry is probably impermanence, underlined by the alternation of life and death (Candiani, 2005, p. 17):

“Dust already chases  
The Lady who was born yesterday  
In order to return her to dust  
As though she is a cloud –  
This is an evening when the Lady is October  
That occurs to someone  
Because leaves fall”.

Another clear reference to Buddhist teachings is the diminishing of the ego through the principle of the non-self and a projection into the wholeness of nature (Candiani 2014, 1, p. 119):

“At times  
I am just not there  
I am the entirety of the air  
And specks of dust  
Vibrating under the impact of others,  
Under the impact of others’ gestures and breath  
[...]”.

Related to her Buddhist views are also, of course, some of her outlooks on life. She says that Buddhist “practice coincides with welcoming life as it is, and us as we are” (Candiani 2014, 2).

Her minimalist style touches upon deep existential areas in light language and imagery that are at times reminiscent of the haiku. One example (Candiani, 2005, p. 27):

“Black Birds  
Across the glass of the window  
It looks as though they are driven  
The Lady teaches them how to fly  
And then forsakes them –  
Let it snow  
On the Japanese magnolia  
On the gate  
On the shadows of the meadow”.

Summing up on Candiani, we notice several Asian/European interactions in her work, an exploration of the unconscious, and a sense of belonging in the meditative tradition of Buddhism but also a claim to freshness, simplicity and originality. In her view, poetry appear to discover and renew rather than express sheer theological truths.

A somehow different case can be made for Roberto Carifi (born in 1948), one of the members of a school of poetics called myth-modernism (Bertoni 2006). In the 1980s and 1990s he formulated his interest in spirituality discerned as myth and as an intertext including reference to European 19th-century Romanticism and early 20th-century Western Modernism. In the last two decades, after conversion, he has often devoted his work to Buddhism.

His Tibet is a collection of poetry inspired by Tibetan philosophy and landscape, and in particular, as mentioned above, by the Bardo Todol, or the book exploring the borderland between the word of the dead and rebirth.

Tibet is a cohesively spiritual volume that avoids any trite approach to becoming, makes the transition to death/rebirth both personal, enigmatic, and somehow coherent with Buddhist teachings (Carifi, p. 9):

“Find out where nothingness is,  
Where your disguise and your snow are,  
Then start climbing  
Upper and upper, until you reach an open space  
Where you hear a weeping,  
A weeping howling -  
You feel transformed,  
The arms wide open”.

One culturally shared link between West and East is the term “souls”, depicted as a memory of Dante’s Inferno but also as Buddhist entities dispersed in plural Hells, and Jungian symbols situated in the depths of the unconscious (Carifi, p. 30):

I set camp by the stupa,  
There seemed to be live souls  
While they were transporting me towards the heights.  
From up there they showed me the Earth.  
Close to the stupa there is a gaze  
That teaches how to look from near  
Under Hells and swamps, under illnesses  
Under strokes that take root and skulls that break,  
But elsewhere souls pass  
Into the indiscriminate deep end of things”.

The Buddha comes as a borderland figure into the dreamy, mountainous landscape. Defined by being undetermined in terms of matter, the Buddha asserts his identity, and asks to be just one of us. By doing so, he provides a new identity: “[...] / He who comes is neither earth nor water / But says I am the Buddha, / Take me among yourselves”. The route of this book includes the achievement of “Samadhi” (Carifi, p. 35), a disembodiment when “the body [...] became prayer” (Carifi, p. 38), the overcoming of suffering by “Embracing all wounds / Mine as well as the blood of other. / There will be no suffering in all of this. / There will only be endless conifer trees” (Carifi, p. 51).

Finally, peace takes over through rebirth of the narrative voice as a follower of Bodhisattvas:

“The country is full of deeds, yaks  
Sheep and Kumbum smile, the one hundred thousand  
images of the Buddha,  
I find myself there and listen to the silence  
After having seen cliffs, followed the images of evil,  
Eavesdropped at doors that open onto the dead.  
Later on, snow falls slowly. The bodhisattvas,  
Those enlightened beings, show the path to all,  
Men and animals, and I follow them, too”.

In brief, becoming is a strong dimension of Carifi’s Tibet, and it takes place through transmigration and rebirth as a spiritually oriented being after the Bardo. This is both a metaphysical persuasion that life continues after death, and a symbolic dimension that might be

applied to metamorphosis of human beings into better persons during the course of their earthly lives.

Such an emphasis on becoming is also accentuated in Giulia Niccolai’s work. Born in 1934, she belonged in the Italian neo-Avantgarde literary movements in the 1960s and 1970s when she wrote experimental poetry concerned with language innovation, anti-establishment satire, and expression of extraverted vitality. A major change took place in her life and texts in the 1980s. She converted to Buddhism, and she finally became a Buddhist monk from a Tibetan school in 1990.

Buddhist meditation acted on Niccolai’s creativity initially as a block to writing in general and in a second phase to writing in her previous humorous and secular register. In the latter stage, she wrote prose work, for instance essays including texts on her motivations to become a Buddhist and on coincidence and synchronicity (Niccolai 2001), and some spiritual poems. One example of these is “Three meditations” (Niccolai 1999-2001), where we find lines such as the following:

“A mole in its den,  
A seed in a pumpkin,  
Isolate from any external stimuli,  
Slowly calm down  
The tyrant blazing  
Of the five senses, and become acquainted  
Sweetly with death  
[...]”.

However, she has more recently returned to her original inspiration in a new light by expressing jovially ironic observations on daily life in old age, this time, rather than in polemical ways, in terms of acceptance of things as they are and of a joyful presence in a content existence (Niccolai 2012).

#### 4. Conclusion

The present essay had the main purpose to show how Buddhism has become a relevant cultural reality in Italy. Within the framework of borderlands of becoming, belonging and sharing, Italian Buddhists, and the poets mentioned here, have added interesting cross-cultural and transnational dimensions to the Italian literary canon and to society at large.

Full references can be found in the Table of References Section.

# Jeanette Winterson's *Stone Gods* as Trans-world and Trans-gender Dystopia

MICHAELA WEISS, SILESIAN UNIVERSITY, CZECH REPUBLIC

Dystopias have been gaining on popularity, especially since the publication of Aldous Huxley's (1894–1963) *Brave New World* (1932), followed by George Orwell's (1903–1950) *Nineteen Eighty-Four* (1949). Such critical and apocalyptic narratives stemmed out of the twentieth century reality and as such can be considered a modern genre. Reflecting the dehumanizing effects of mechanization and globalization, dystopias presented a warning from the future that could be even more destructive than the present. The original optimism and belief in science and progress that is a characteristic feature of modernity collapsed into the sense of alienation and fragmentation, uncovering the darker side of the utopia. Needless to say, these concepts are not opposites, as professor of history of science Michael Gordin et al. observed:

A true opposite of utopia would be a society that is either completely unplanned or is planned to be deliberately terrifying and awful. Dystopia, typically invoked, is neither of these things; rather, it is a utopia that has gone wrong, or a utopia that functions only for a particular segment of society (Gordin 2010, p. 1).

In modernity utopias and dystopias were mainly located on an island or hidden city, yet, due to the increasingly unprecedented level of internationalization, the world has become too small for ideal communities or plans and the crisis is reaching and affecting whole human race, not only its fraction. That is why Winterson locates her potentially saving ground into space, being aware of the fact that our planet cannot offer substantial space that would enable the whole mankind to relocate safely and does not trust in betterment of the existing nations as is shown on the repeated cycle of the same destructive decisions. On the other hand, as the planet project is doomed, Winterson questions and undermines the idea of space colonization, pointing out the devastating cultural and ecological consequences of conquering other nations and spaces, adopting a more critical view towards the social system, yet, at the same time, suggesting alternative spaces or communities that could counterpoint the dominant rule.

*Stone Gods* consists of three seemingly independent narratives reaching a time span over several centuries. While the first section is set in the future and deals with a colonization of another planet, the second returns to

the history of Easter Island, while the third is set in near-future. The stories are interconnected not only by the common theme of human greed and irresponsible economic and anti-ecological behavior, but also by the central character Billie/Billy Crusoe and Spike/Spickers whose gender and sex change throughout the texts, yet their characters remain; thus adopting a motif first employed by Virginia Woolf (1882–1941) in her fictional biography *Orlando* (1928), which addresses the issues of androgyny, bisexuality, homosexuality and gender performance, illustrated on a life story of a young nobleman Orlando who lives for four hundred years, unchanged at the age of thirty and during his life turns biologically into a woman.



Jeanette Winterson (Chris Boland - Creative Commons)

While Woolf ventured into the past and gradually shifted towards the present, Winterson does not observe any chronological or linear pattern. The novel opens in a distant future when the world is divided into three



political segments: the Central Power, Caliphate and Sino-Moscow Pact that are negotiating the system of colonization of a new planet Blue. Even though the planet is in its early stage of development and is habituated by dinosaurs, the Central Power government is presenting it as ideal and life-saving to gain public support for the colonization:

“The new planet offers us the opportunity to do things differently. We’ve had a lot of brilliant successes here on Orbus – well, we are the success story of the universe, aren’t we? [ . . . ] But we have taken a few wrong turnings. Made a few mistakes. [ . . . ] Conflict is likely. A new planet means we can redistribute ourselves. It will mean a better quality of life for everyone – the ones who leave, and the ones who stay” (Winterson 2007, pp. 4–5).

The ruling elite thus imposes the image of the bright future on the masses. By making the new world publicly attractive, the government creates a utopian vision for the masses by connecting it to the nation’s colonialist past, especially of Indies, Americas and Arctic circles. The image of future paradise has to be perfect so that no opposition towards the mission could arise. As the Central Power regulates and controls the seemingly democratic and ecological distribution of resources, its chief interest is to keep the majority satisfied and reassured of the common good it would produce, preventing any suggestions concerning the saving of the current planet. According to Horkheimer and Adorno, such government prevents independent thinking and encourages “diversion and amusement, the security of identification with authority, and the comfort of conformity. The ‘world of administered life’ creates such individuals and efficiently meets their needs. Within such a world the capacity to think that things might be otherwise, or even to feel such a need, has been repressed” (Alway 1995, p. 42). To avoid any accusation of potential violence, the government proclaims that the “[m]onsters will be humanely destroyed” (Winterson 2007, p. 6). The extermination of local inhabitants, no matter what they are, as long as they are hostile to modern “civilized” life, is generally accepted as necessary for the survival of superior species: the white Western capitalist society.

Since utopia has become mainly associated with the elite that would come up with the ideal distribution of power, wealth and material, it has acquired a rather negative connotation. According to Gordin et al.:

It carries with it the trappings of an elaborate thought experiment, a kind of parlor game for intellectuals who set themselves the task of designing a future society, a perfect society—following the pun on the name in Greek (no place, good place: imaginary yet positive) (Gordin 2010, p. 1).

Even seemingly equal distribution of wealth is still viewed as unsatisfactory as it becomes utopian only for a ruling fraction society, whereas the others are limited in their freedom of thought or expression. According to Habermas: “Liberation from hunger and misery does not necessarily converge with liberation from servitude and degradation, for there is no automatic developmental relation between labor and interaction” (Habermas 1973, p. 169). That can be one of the major reasons why dystopias often attack the originally utopian leftist world visions. Even Winterson undermines the seemingly socialist establishment by creating a society without private ownership based on ecological awareness and renting. Moreover, humans are genetically fixed at certain age of his/her choice so nobody gets old, sick or ugly. Yet, as she points out, even this state does not lead to fulfillment or happiness, but rather causes multiple deviations and perversions, especially in the sexual sphere as most people look the same: young and beautiful, only celebrities are enhanced to look even better. Equal distribution of beauty, youth and wealth leads to alienation and boredom: “All men are hung like whales. All women are tight as clams below and inflated like lifebuoys above. Jaws are square, skin is tanned, muscles are toned, and no one gets turned on” (Winterson 2007, p. 23). As sexual adventures present the only form of release of self-expression, the women try to comply with various male appetites, especially concerning their looks and age, while men have small girls imported from the Caliphate, as the Central Power outlawed pedophilia.

The utopian image presented to the masses can be thus seen as a political and ideological tool for manipulation of dependent subjects. Moreover, as the new world is ruled by technology and all human activities were transferred onto machines, the humanity is slowly degrading, while the robots are growing more sophisticated, especially a new kind called robo sapiens that looks human and is capable of evolution, though within limits. While humans rely on the technology in every aspect of their lives, they gradually lose their skills and abilities, ending up defenseless against the manipulative rule, confirming Horkheimer’s and Adorno’s claim that the masses “insist on the very ideology which enslaves them” (Horkheimer and Adorno 1972, p. 136), and are readily trapped into the cycle of pre-given social frame, as long as they can follow their entertainment. They prove to have an almost “enigmatic readiness [...] to fall under the sway of any despotism” (Horkheimer and Adorno 1972, p. xiii).

Similarly to other feminist dystopias, Stone Gods address not only the destinies of individual characters, but focus on the very structure of the ruling system and the origin and causes of both dys- and utopian visions, affirming Patricia Melzer’s claim that “[science fiction female writers] create explicit political narratives that do not just center on an individual’s subjectivity but address systems

that shape our world: social, technological, economic, and political systems” (Melzer 2006, p. 179). In contrast with the predominantly predatory and destructive nature of men and their ruling system, women are mainly portrayed either as victims or active opponents of the system, using their common sense, emotions and insight to save the planet or restore the natural order and balance.

The protagonist Billie Crusoe works for the Enhancement service that is responsible for making people know what is good for them and their community. Yet, she only accepted the position to be able to keep her small farm, a little utopia of her own, which was considered archaic and even anarchic. She does share the general enthusiasm for re-settling and believes in restoration of the old planet: “We didn’t do anything, did we? Just fucked it to death and then kicked it when it wouldn’t get up” (Winterson 2007, p. 8). Feeling responsible for the environment, Billie tries to hide in her limited natural preserve and believes in re-establishment of the ecological balance. The same is true for women on the Easter Island from the second narrative, who try to prevent the local chiefs from putting down the last tree. Yet, the men are deaf and blind to their cries, beat them up and collectively take the tree down. Winterson here again refers to potentially saving and healing community of women that has the capacity and feeling to save the Earth, in opposition to men’s strength and reason, which is often destructive.

Winterson also questions the future of women within such a system: “We don’t breed in the womb anymore, and if we aren’t wanted for sex...But there always will be men. Women haven’t gone for little boys. Women have a different approach. Surrounded by hunks, they look for the ‘ugly man inside’. [...] So this is the future. F is for Future” (Winterson 2007, p. 26). The victimization of women is illustrated on a case Billie is assigned to. Mrs. Pink McMurphy wants to be genetically reversed to the age of twelve to revive her husband’s sexual interest. Even though such a procedure is possible, it is not common or supported; Billie is supposed to investigate the case and persuade the woman to change her decision. Yet, all attempts at rational reasoning are hopeless as Mrs. McMurphy behaves like a small girl, turning their house into pink teenage dream, willing to comply with her husband’s pedophilic desires: “Y’know, I’d be fucked up and miserable anyway – and if I’m going to be fucked up and miserable, I’d rather be young, fucked up and miserable. Who wants to be depressed and have skin that looks like fried onions?” (Winterson 2007, p. 70)

While she fusses about her appearance and desperately tries to become attractive, young and beautiful, her husband is frequenting Peccadillo, a bar for unusual sexual services. It offers translucent waiters, “[w]hen you fuck them you can watch yourself doing it. It’s

pornography for introverts” (Winterson 2007, p. 22), woman with mouths instead of her nipples and one leg for easier access, children, or a dog woman with animals included. The husband loves young children and is prepared to have fixed a nine-year old girl from the Caliphate, even though it is illegal. He supports his wife’s wish and even proclaims his deviation as acceptable and normal: “It’s like every other Civil Rights and Equal Rights battle, OK? You had Blacks at one time. You had Semites at one time. You had mixed marriages, you had gays. All legal, no problem. We’re just victims of prejudice and out-of-date laws” (Winterson 2007, p. 25).

Winterson may present bizarre sexual appetites and adaptations, yet, she operates within the bi-polar gender and biological sex system. Her characters, no matter if gay or heterosexual, are always males or females, men or women. She thus challenges only the heteronormative system, which is typical for all her writing, yet does not go beyond it. Even her robo sapiens Spike has a body that looks female while under the upper tissue there is fully mechanical construction.

The effect of imposed social roles upon women is further demonstrated on the relationship between Billie and Spike that develops on the space mission to planet Blue. Spike starts to feel emotions and breaks the limits designed for keeping the evolution of robo sapiens under control. Captain Handsome hopes to enrich her emotion scale by starting an affair with her and Spike is more than willing to learn, yet only from Billie. The novel starts to follow their romantic relationship that gradually strengthens and overcomes any prejudice. The originally highly political and ecological tale thus turns into a lesbian interspecies romance, in which Winterson once again distorts and challenges gender expectations.

In the space Spike starts to understand the social nature of gender and by choosing Billie rather than Captain Handsome asserts a right for choice of partners. Whereas on her previous mission she served not only a perfect intelligent machine but her construction corresponded with the image of a perfect female body so that she could provide sexual services. Moreover, she programmed in such a way as to be willing to perform her role.

Throughout the text, Spike is viewed and classified as a woman, Winterson here echoes the theories of Simone de Beauvoir. While de Beauvoir who claimed that “[o]ne is not born, but rather becomes a woman. No biological, psychic, economic destiny determines [...] the human female. [...] It is civilisation as a whole that produces this creature, intermediate between male and eunuch, which is described as feminine” (De Beauvoir 1949, p. 281). Her views were further developed by Monique Wittig, who undermines the whole concept of a woman, which she aims at destroying and deconstructing. According to Wittig, the concept of woman is “still imprisoned in the

categories of sex (woman and man), but holds onto the idea that the capacity to give birth (biology) is what defines a woman” (Wittig 2003, p. 250). Winterson completely omits the biological basis of woman as neither Billie nor Spike desire pregnancy. Moreover, the robo sapiens cannot conceive and has only an exchangeable silicon-lined vagina, still, she is treated as a woman, yet her exploitation is not based on reproductive but solely sexual purposes. Paraphrasing de Beauvoir, Spike was not born, but constructed a woman. Being a woman thus turns out to be both social and technological construct, which leads to naturalizing the social (male) needs. As Wittig observes:

But what we believe to be a physical and direct perception is only a sophisticated and mythic construction, an ‘imagery formation,’ which reinterprets physical features (in themselves neutral as any others but marked by the social system) through the network of relationships in which they are perceived (Wittig pp. 249–250).

Being aware of the mechanical and un-natural construction of Spike’s body, which is “sophisticated and mythic”, Billie does not want to get involved with a creature she does not perceive as a woman: “I don’t want to get personal,’ I said, ‘but I’ll say it again – you are a robot. Do you want to kiss a woman so that you can add it to your database?’ ‘Gender is a human concept,’ said Spike, ‘and not very interesting. I want to kiss you.’ She kissed me again” (Winterson 2007, p. 76). Despite her mechanical nature, Spike is deeply inspired by and is determined to find out what it is like to be loved the way it was presented in the poem, ignoring Billie’s protests that she does not want to be a robot enhancement.

Billie is trapped within the imposed understanding of femininity, even though she, as a lesbian, does not fit the heteronormative system. She still upholds the prescribed norm of a natural, biological woman, even though there are close to none in the world she lives in. Most females are genetically fixed or transformed, superficially reaching for the new social ideal they cannot fit in. Even though Billie did not undergo any genetic alteration, she tried to hide it and besides, looked beautiful and looked young enough to pass. While she is critical to the trends dictated by the system that women have followed, she does not directly oppose them.

After initial mistrust and following the limited view of the concept of a sex and gender, Spike persuades Billie to get beyond the obsolete definitions and constructions and rely on her emotions instead:

My lover is made of a meta-material, a polymer tough as metal, but pliable and flexible and capable of heating and cooling, just like human skin. [...] She has no limbic system because she is not designed to feel emotion.

She has no blood. She can’t give birth. Her hair and nails don’t grow. She doesn’t eat or drink. She is solar-powered. She has learned how to cry (Winterson 2007, p. 83).

Both “women” reject the traditional bipolar gender division, which Spike dismisses as “human concept” and “not very interesting” (Winterson 2007, p. 76). Changing the way of Billie’s constrained thinking, Spike can now be loved and celebrated as a woman she read about in poetry, fulfilling Wittig’s ideal of lesbian being a “not-woman” and “not-man” (Wittig p. 251).

However, Winterson pushes the boundaries of femininity or humanity even further in the last narrative, which chronologically predates the opening one. In the world that faces the consequences of the third world war, a young scientist Billie is responsible for the first robo sapiens, Spike, who was created to ensure the world’s piece and sustainability. Though still beautiful as in the first section, Spike has no body, only a head. Their relationship with Billie is thus purely platonic, yet equally strong.

Spike as an intelligent robo sapiens understands the nature of oppression and is prepared to help to establish a new, more democratic system, as she is aware of the fact that humans degraded to such an extent that they cannot stand up for themselves anymore:

Humans have given away all their power to a “they”. You aren’t able to fight the system because without the system none of you can survive. You made a world without alternatives, and now it is dying, and your new world already belongs to “they” (Winterson 2007, p. 79).

As she realizes that man/womankind is too comfortable within the established system that it cannot effectively resist it, she stands as an example of breaking the rules fore-set for her by shifting her evolutionary limits beyond her predefined possibilities. She rejects the categories based on the political system requirements that are still founded on the obsolete biological distinction. Winterson realized that for a change of a system, individual changes of thinking and perception have to come first:

In the days before we invented spacecraft, we dreamed of flying saucers, but what we finally built were rockets: fuel-greedy, inefficient and embarrassingly phallic. When we realized how to fly vast distances at light-speed, we went back to the saucer shape: a disc with solar sails. Strange to dream in the right shape and build in the wrong shape, but maybe that is what we do every day, never believing that a dream could tell the truth (Winterson 2007, p. 75).

Placing an emphasis on dreams, intuition and openness towards love and emotions, corresponds to Horkheimer's and Adorno's claim that the regression of subjected mankind is caused by their "inability to hear the unheard of with their own ears, to touch the unapprehended with their own hands" (Horkheimer and Adorno 1972, p. 36). The belief in technology also leads to a destruction of the planet and the explorers, as the asteroid that is meant to exterminate the dinosaurs, sends the planet into Ice Age. This mission exemplifies just another case of colonization that brought disasters both to the space and its inhabitants, similarly to the Easter Island, where the natives used up all wood and stone available on the land to build large moai statues of faces of deified ancestors. As a result, the island turned into inhospitable dessert: "The island was stripped and bare, with few trees or shrub-bushes of any kind. Nature seemed hardly to have provided it with any fit thing for man to eat or drink (Winterson 2007, p.118).

Winterson, however, manages to combine the social criticism with stories of common individuals, showing the effects of the destructive power on human lives. To prove her trans-gender attitude, this narrative features a sailor and member of the colonizing crew Billy, whose life is saved by one of the natives with European origin Spikkers. Yet, their relationship becomes immediately more intimate as Spikkers expects a reward: "I put my hand down to where he was stiff and soon had him tidy and soft again (Winterson 2007, p. 128). Similarly to the other narratives, their romance slowly develops into mutual love, care and understanding, emphasizing the universality of human experience.

While Billy offers an outsider's and observer's perspective, Spikkers explains the events from the inside, though the fact that he can speak English, Spanish and can write, partly excludes him from the community. As the robo sapiens from the previous section, he is more "technically developed" and dreams of the peace and order on the island, yet as he cannot step out of the system, he is choosing between two chiefs who both proved destructive in their leadership. On the other hand, Billy who lands involuntarily on the island and is left behind by his crew, only learns of the effects of "civilizing" other lands from the native's narrative. Still, even their good intentions and attempts to bring the island back to its tradition and order fail, not due to their lack of abilities, but male competitiveness that leads to Spikker's death. Their only legacy is their mutual love: "[I] licked the blood from his mouth and tried to give him my breath and I would have given him one of my

legs and one of my arms and one of my kidneys and half of my liver and four pints of my blood and all easy for I had already given him my heart. Do not die" (Winterson 2007, p. 139).

As long as there are Billies and Spikk/ers, mankind will remain human, as for Winterson same-sex relationships disrupt not only the heteronormative system but also the social constructs of man or woman: "Truth tell, anywhere is a life, once there is love" (Winterson 138). In both sections it was homosexual love freed from prejudice and system requirements that led to at least individual and subjective redemption, while the rest of humanity did not oppose the establishment, they complied with the imposed limitations and entered just another destructive cycle of human history, often closely linked to devastating colonization and "civilization" of both the land and its inhabitants. As in most of Winterson's novels, *Stone Gods* consists of parallel stories from various times and spaces, suggesting a cyclical view of human history. "Everything is imprinted forever with what it was once was" (Winterson 2007, p. 246). The pattern from past colonizing of the unknown lands and islands is repeated with the new planet, while the characters and consequences are always the same.

Yet, the main theme of the book is not the colonization of other planet suitable for life as it may seem from the first part; Winterson shows great awareness of the roots and causes of dystopian thinking. As anti/dys/u-topias reflect the state of contemporary and historical events, she is tracing the human qualities and general circumstances leading to the state of crisis. While the first part of the book deals with catastrophic consequences of colonizing a new planet, the second part goes back to the time of Easter Island's exploration and the third part returns to near-future, where Billie finds a manuscript in a metro called *The Stone Gods*, the whole planet Blue is thus suddenly turned into fiction, what remains is the desolate past and equally hopeless present. What is mankind left with is a planet that used to be blue, and a capacity for poetry and love. By providing redemptive models and alternatives, Winterson confirms the dystopia's corrective function of idealized societies; even when her characters failed in their political missions. Their realization of oppressive social constructs and politics creates a space for negotiation between new utopian possibilities and fully hopeless and negative dystopian future.

**Full references can be found in the Table of References Section.**

# Becoming-other to Belong: Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism in Jeff Noon's Nymphomation

EMMA NICOLETTI  
UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA, AUSTRALIA

In Jeff Noon's *Nymphomation* (2000), the reader is confronted with a fictional Manchester city where swarms of mobile, flying adverts increasingly pollute the air and piles of discarded lottery tokens increasingly litter the streets. This undesirable environment is the result of the technologies of post-industrial capitalism turned rampant, where the imperative to turn a profit also turns the environment uninhabitable. However, *Nymphomation* has a "hero", Jazir, the son of Indian migrants, whose 1) ideological transformation from entrepreneurial capitalist to social justice advocate, and 2) ontological transformation from human to posthuman, reduces and reverses the city's decline into an uninhabitable anthropogenic climate.

This discussion will focus on Jazir and the way the novel can be read as pairing his cosmopolitan, migrant perspective with his ability to perceive his embeddedness within a more-than-human community. This ability allows him to negotiate and mitigate the increasing hostility of his anthropogenic climate. Moreover, I will discuss how the novel envisions responding to environmental crisis as requiring more than technical solutions. "Reduce, reuse, recycle" is not enough in *Nymphomation*. Instead, *Nymphomation* suggests that responding and adapting to anthropogenic climates requires a radical reconsideration of the way humans perceive themselves and their relation to the human and nonhuman other. What I call a radical eco-subjectivity. Here too the novel suggests that it is Jazir's cosmopolitan perspective that enables him to enter into this ontological transformation. In short, I will argue that in the character of Jazir, *Nymphomation* envisions a model for a radical eco-cosmopolitan subjectivity that combines 1) the emancipatory potential of the cosmopolitan perspective with 2) an ecological understanding of the interconnectedness of the human and nonhuman. And furthermore, that this reading of the novel suggests that the dual cultural perspective of cosmopolitan subjects better enables them to perceive their dual species citizenship—that is, that they belong to a more-than-human community. This altered perspective leaves the eco-cosmopolitan subject well-positioned to negotiate and mitigate anthropocentric climates.

By reading the novel from this perspective, I am engaging in the practice of ecocriticism. Ecocriticism is an analytical perspective that emerged as a movement in the mid-1990s in response to an increasing awareness of anthropogenic climate change, and a concern that this issue was not being adequately addressed in the work of humanities' scholars. Ecocriticism seeks to explicitly address these issues by interrogating the ways culture and cultural products mediate humans' relation to the nonhuman. In particular, it seeks to do so by focusing on the nuanced ways culture and cultural products reinforce and/or challenge dominant values and attitudes regarding humans' connection to the nonhuman. This analysis engages with *Nymphomation* from such an ecocritical perspective. It seeks to elucidate the ways this novel reflects upon, challenges and offers alternatives to the values, attitudes and understandings that currently dominant the relation between the human and nonhuman (in our current globalised economy).

Furthermore, in the reading of *Nymphomation* I present here, I will borrow and elaborate upon ecocritic Ursula Heise's concept of eco-cosmopolitanism (2008). Heise's concept draws upon theories of cosmopolitanism that are "concerned with the question of how we might be able to develop cultural forms of identity and belonging that are commensurate with the rapid growth in political, economic, and social interconnectedness that has characterised [contemporary globalisation]" (2008, p.6). And she seeks to extend the concept to include the "more-than-human world—the realm of nonhuman species, but also that of connectedness with both animate and inanimate networks of influence and exchange" (2008, p.61). Heise extends the idea in this way to construct a more robust conception of cosmopolitanism, which she deems necessary for anthropocentric ecologies.

This ecocritical reading of *Nymphomation* is divided into the following three sections: firstly, I offer a brief introduction to *Nymphomation* and discuss how globalisation figures in the novel; secondly, I present an argument highlighting how Jazir can be read as representing a cosmopolitan subject position; and thirdly, I demonstrate how Jazir's belonging to a more-than-human community destabilises his ontological status as

human and enables him to negotiate his anthropogenic climate.

## Nymphomation and Globalisation

Like Jeff Noon's other science fiction novels of the 1990s, *Nymphomation* is set in a fictionalised version of the author's hometown of Manchester. The plot centres upon a lottery newly introduced to the city by the AnnoDomino Company as a test run before the lottery's national launch. The lottery is run weekly and players enter the draw by buying tokens called domino bones. The ultimate cash prize of "10 million lovelies" is won if the dots on the domino bones settle on the same dots as those broadcast on the televised draw (16).

The AnnoDomino Company and how it came to be in Noon's fictional Manchester provide some telling intertextual connections. In the novel, the Manchester city council successfully bids for AnnoDomino to test their lotto game in the city, recalling Manchester's multiple Olympic and Commonwealth Games bids (Cochrane et al. 2002). Also, the company enters into "partnerships" with the city's public institutions, recalling the same strategy employed by the real Manchester's local council to be able to compete for national funds (a strategy which departed from the city's long-standing commitment to public institutions and welfare) (Quilley 2002). These connections draw attention to the ways the novel engages Manchester's changing identity from globaliser—centre of trade and industry, to globalised—vulnerable to losing its socialist-leaning identity. Indeed, AnnoDomino represents one negative tendency of globalisation—its propensity to instantiate globally homogenised cultural values. In this case, the values of materialism and post-industrial capitalism.

In the novel, AnnoDomino aggressively advertises its lottery game via insect shaped broadcasting systems that can fly: these mobile advertising units are called blurbflies and are designed to communicate the AnnoDomino advertisement—"play to win"—"alive and direct to the punters" (75). Driven by the blurbflies' relentlessly repeated advertisements, the Mancunians buy several dominoes each week. However, after failing to be the winning token, the losing domino pieces are invalidated. The Mancunian's toss away their losing tokens: the numbers of discarded dominoes become so numerous they create a "second pavement that crunch[s] underfoot" (254). The blurbflies thus pollute the environment in two ways: they are too plentiful and so pollute the air, and the advertisement they broadcast promotes the materialistic message of over-consumption, driving further pollution.

Jazir operates as a foil to the AnnoDomino Company. Jazir seeks to discover the mysterious technology that powers the blurbflies and domino tokens, and discover why the company is having some of its players murdered. These motives see Jazir at one point capturing a blurbfly

to profit from its technology, at another point hacking into the company's database to uncover its nefarious activities, and at another point destroying the company's factory headquarters. This last action, destroying the factory, is central to this argument as it sees the blurbflies emancipated from their contract with the AnnoDomino Company, it is associated with the release of the Mancunians from the regency of the materialist values engendered by AnnoDomino, and both of these together ameliorate the city's environmental problems.

Importantly, Jazir and his family, the Malik's, represent another intertextual link to the real Manchester and its place within global networks, that is, as Peter Dickin's notes, the "large-scale in-migration of people [to England] from the former colonies" (2002, p.23). The Malik family are migrants of Indian origin and run a curry restaurant located in Rusholme. In the real Manchester, the Rusholme area is known for its high concentration of Indian restaurants, earning it the nickname "curry mile". *Nymphomation* points to the intercultural tensions arising from this situation, which is played out in confrontations between Jazir and white supremacist Nigel Zuze. Nigel's personal blurbfly advertises the following message: "English schools for English tools. No foreign muck. Vote for Purity!" (36). Nigel represents the attitude that migrants are a threat to the integrity of England's national identity and Manchester's local identity. Noon, however, encourages the reader to be unsympathetic towards Nigel and his perspective—he is a racist bully-cum-coward and all-round objectionable character. Jazir, on the other hand, is complex and sympathetic character. Indeed, his increasingly deft ability to combine his dual experience of Indian and English cultures is the avenue through which the novel's conflicts are resolved. Jazir thus represents a contradictory tendency enabled by globalisation, that is, its propensity for heterogeneity. The novel inscribes the melding of cultures as producing new ways of knowing and being that can resist globally competitive corporations and anthropogenic climates.

## Jazir and Cosmopolitanism

Indeed, it is Jazir's cosmopolitan perspective that allows him to perceive the interconnectedness of the human and nonhuman via his altered relationship to the blurbflies. As already mentioned, at one point in the story Jazir hacks AnnoDomino's computer system. This covert activity results in his being bitten by a blurbfly, and, in turn, this corporeal connection instigates his understanding that he and the blurbflies belong to the same ecosystem and are both subject to the same fate. That is, their survival is threatened by the values of materialism and post-industrial capitalism espoused by AnnoDomino. Here I will demonstrate the centrality of Jazir's cosmopolitanism to the novel's resolution by foregrounding how it is his dual Indian-English perspective that brings him into corporeal contact with

the blurbfly in the first instance, and that it is this dual cultural perspective that underpins his ability to become a member of the blurbfly community.

Firstly, Jazir is able to hack the AnnoDomino system, something which other Mancunians are unable to do, by incorporating and adapting aspects from his dual Indian-English heritage. Notable in this respect is his “Info Josh” password hacking program—an amalgamation of his knowledge of computer coding and Indian cuisine:

INFO JOSH[:] Ginger, garlic water. Put them all into a karahi. Add chunks of information to brown. Cardamom, bay leaves, cloves. [...] Stir and serve. The wanted knowledge will be revealed. Heat rating: red hot”. (71)

For Jazir, combining ideas from different cultures and different generations is “the way of the world”: “Father Saeed Malik cooked up the spices; Jaz, the son, cooked up the info. Mutual engineering” (71). It is bringing together different kinds of knowledge in this way that leads Jazir to being bitten by a blurbfly: Jazir discovers that running the Info Josh program on a computer pacifies and attracts the blurbflies, making them easy to catch. The blurbfly that Jazir seizes bites him, transferring some of the mutagenic DNA to Jazir in the process. It is this corporeal encounter with a blurbfly the eventually enables Jazir to empathise with their species, which leads to his involvement in mitigating the city’s environmental problems.

Secondly, Jazir’s ability to become a member of the blurbfly community after being bitten is also connected to his ability to accommodate and combine different kinds of cultural knowledge. After being bitten, Jazir notices that he begins to change. He experiences the urge to “swarm with the [blurbfly] pack” (274). That is, he begins to perceive himself as belonging to the blurbfly community. However, he also reports an irresistible loyalty to AnnoDomino, compelling him “to stand on the tallest building and shout out loud to the city how fucking great the Anno-Dominoes are” (274). In other words, he begins to perceive his agency being subsumed by AnnoDomino. Nonetheless, Jazir possesses the desire to resist his total transformation into a blurbfly advert, and also the skill to incorporate both humanness and blurbfly-ness into his identity.

A comparison with the aforementioned character Nigel illustrates how Jazir’s cosmopolitanism underpins his ability to resist. Nigel is “infected” with the same mutagenic material as Jazir, but unlike Jazir, Nigel is unable to resist the contagion and is immediately made into AnnoDomino’s slave. Nigel’s resistance seems linked to his inability to accept the racial-ethnic other, as evidenced by his blurbfly advertisement’s message of white supremacy. Nigel’s identity is founded upon his active and violent attempts to exclude the other. Nigel’s

inability to accommodate the racial-ethnic other frustrates his ability accommodate the nonhuman other, leading to his complete vulnerability and subservience to the virus. On the other hand, Jazir’s ability to negotiate between and incorporate aspects of different cultures is associated with his ability to accommodate the virus, and simultaneously belong to both the blurbfly and human communities, as well as resist AnnoDomino’s materialism.

## Becoming-other and Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism

Finally, I will address the cornerstone of my reading of the novel’s model of radical eco-subjectivity—what I call Jazir’s becoming-blurbfly. Jazir’s ability to productively incorporate aspects of two cultures—Indian and English, underpins his ability to incorporate aspects of two species—human and blurbfly. I want to make two points about Jazir’s blended or hybrid subjectivity: firstly, it replaces the either/or dualisms that support traditional Western models of subjectivity with a both/and foundation, and secondly, it suggests that reconfiguring the foundations of subjectivity in this way is necessary for continued existence and belonging in anthropogenic climates.

However, first it is important to clarify what is meant by becoming-blurbfly, and explain how this challenges the either/or dualisms that support the Western model of subjectivity. In calling Jazir’s experience “becoming-blurbfly” I am referring to the concept of becoming as developed by Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari in *A Thousand Plateaus* (1987). For Deleuze and Guattari, the process of becoming is intertwined with the radical transformation of the Western subject. Traditionally the concept of the Western subject has been built upon a series of hierarchally organised binary oppositions, including self/other, presence/absence, human/nature, man/woman, etc. As eco-philosopher Val Plumwood argues, such a dualist and hierarchal organisation hyper-separates each category so that the identity of each term of the binary is defined through its radical exclusion and repudiation of the opposing term (1993, pp.10–11). In the case of human/nature, for example, the term “human” becomes synonymous with the notion of disembodied mind, and “nature” becomes synonymous with material “stuff”. The consequence of this, Plumwood argues, is that the dominant group comes to deny their dependency upon the repressed other (1993, pp.48–9). For the human/nature binary, the effect is that humans see themselves as independent, autonomous agents, able to master and control a subordinate, nonhuman nature without being altered themselves. However, Deleuze and Guattari’s “subject” of becoming exists in a state that is both partly self and partly other—neither wholly who or what it was, nor wholly who or what it will become, but rather existing at the threshold between these two

“selves”. Such in-between-ness is a logically impossible state of existence for the traditional Western subject. I argue that Jazir’s existence in the state of becoming-blurbfly/becoming-other—where he is neither wholly human, nor wholly blurbfly—registers his radical departure from traditional Western subjectivity.

Jazir’s radically reconfigured subjectivity enables him to perceive his belonging to a more-than-human community. This insight is inscribed as necessary for his—and all Mancunians—continued existence in Manchester’s anthropogenic climate. Jazir’s radically reconfigured subjectivity is coupled with his new-found ability to empathise with and advocate for the blurbflies. This insight leads to his taking actions that destroy AnnoDomino, which reverses the negative environmental impact the company has had on the fictional Manchester city. Jazir’s openness to the blurbflies enables him to see the world from their perspective: Jazir says, “some of the blurbs want out. They want their freedom. That’s why they’re attracted to me. I can turn this knowledge against [AnnoDomino]” (274). Witnessing the world from the nonhuman perspective of the blurbflies, alerts Jazir to the destructive force AnnoDomino exerts over the Mancunians—the Mancunians, like the blurbflies, are controlled by AnnoDomino. The company’s promise of wealth enslaves the Mancunians thinking, so that they are blinded to the social and environmental problems caused by the company. This lack of insight renders the Mancunians unable to resist the company’s materialist values. In short, after Jazir’s corporeal encounter with a blurbfly Jazir begins to belong to the blurbfly community both physically by seeing the world from their point of view and conceptually by foregoing his status as human subject—that is, he relinquishes his perception that he is able to master and profit from the blurbflies and instead pledges to advocate on behalf of the nonhuman (an act

which ultimately benefits the well-being of all the human characters too). Jazir’s indeterminate, becoming-blurbfly subjectivity allows him to 1) perceive the interconnectedness of the situations of the human and nonhuman—both are enslaved by AnnoDomino, and 2) advocate on behalf of the nonhuman which is linked to the restoration of habitable environmental conditions—by destroying the AnnoDomino factory.

## Conclusion

In this discussion I have attempted to outline Nymphomation’s model for a radical eco-cosmopolitan subjectivity. This subjectivity draws upon the potential of cosmopolitanism to enable individuals to negotiate between cultures, and also produce new knowledge through the experience of different cultures. My reading of the novel suggests that the skills and knowledges that accompany such cosmopolitan experiences and perspectives enable similarly open and flexible inter-species understandings. That is, Jazir’s cosmopolitan perspective enables him to exist at the threshold between human-self and nonhuman-other. Moreover, it is this radical, indeterminate subjectivity that 1) enables him to perceive the ways the human and nonhuman are equally implicated in ecosystems, and 2) compels him to advocate on behalf of the nonhuman—an action that restores the increasingly uninhabitable anthropogenic climate. In reading Nymphomation from this ecocritical perspective, I hope to have highlighted the ways this novel can be read as elucidating some important intersections between cosmopolitanism and radical eco-subjectivity.

Full references can be found in the Table of References Section.





# Confinement and Transgression in Eugene O'Neill's *The Hairy Ape* and Arthur Miller's *The Crucible*

HUI CHUN LI  
NATIONAL SUN YAT-SEN UNIVERSITY, TAIWAN

Eugene O'Neill's *The Hairy Ape* (1922) portrays a group of workers in the stokehole of a ship who are disciplined to power up the engine. The leader of the force, Yank, is represented as someone who views the privileged class as idlers who do not belong to his world. Douglas Mildred, daughter of the corporate steel company owner, who considers herself useless and wants to make herself useful to the society, startles Yank by visiting the stokehole. She, in turn, is shocked by his primitive nakedness. Each a mirror to the other, they reveal to each other unseen aspects of their own worlds. When she faints at his appearance, he feels insulted and angry. Yank decides to land on the metropolis where she belongs "in de window of a toy store" (183) and prove to the world that he is not an ape. He enters a world governed by unconscious desires for commodity, rationality and bureaucracy, and ends up being caged in the zoo and killed by an ape. His death is an ultimate transgression, of not given in to a living-dead life (either as workers on assembly-line, or as commodified humans), and a protest against a living confinement.

The self's protest against society is also depicted in Arthur Miller's *The Crucible* (1953). Where Yank protests against commodified life, Miller's protagonist John Proctor's will to transgression is directed against Salem's theocracy. Set in the seventeenth century, Miller rewrites the event of a Salem witch trial and exposes the conflicts between two antagonistic powers: the Topsfield-Nurse faction and old Salemites, the deviant and the norm. Between these two opposing factions an absolute religious doctrine functions as an operational instrument for those in power. Thomas Putnam's clan conspires to overthrow Rebecca Nurse's clan because of Abigail Williams's behavior—dancing at night in the forest, an act the theocratic society deems demon and thus deviant from God's will. Just as Yank is being rejected and confined by the metropolis, so Proctor (representative of those who are victimized in the witchcraft scandal) is put to jail and excommunicated from the church of Salem. The metropolis's utopian goal is to achieve industrial progress and economic prosperity; that of Salem is to establish a totalitarian theocracy, manipulated by Putnam's clan and manifested through

judicial practices. This paper aims to situate both Yank and Proctor as cultural products manufactured by utopian desires, under the cultural conditions of, respectively, industrial society and puritan theocracy. Societies always find ways to remove or confine the deviant; the types of society O'Neill and Miller depict achieve their goals by executing egregiously violent measures to do so. In reaction, such society will trigger a will to transgression and truth in the deviant self.



Photo by Dave Pape (Creative Commons)

In his "O'Neill and the Future of the Theatre" Eugenio Montale mentions that with the influences of Synge, Ibsen and Strindberg, O'Neill's themes oftentimes can be

related to “classical myth and the spiritual dimensions of Greek tragedy” (71). Ralph A. Ciancio in his “Richard Wright, Eugene O’Neill, and *The Beast in the Skull*” sees a similarity between Richard Wright’s *Native Son* and Eugene O’Neill’s *The Hairy Ape*: the underlying message in both plays is that life is a struggle between Heaven and Hell. Both Yank and the protagonist in the *Native Son* are representatives of the working-class who protest against a society that favors capitalists. Ciancio takes the two protagonists as “symbolic Everyman who dangles between animalistic instincts and inchoate, spiritual yearnings” (46). He argues that *The Hairy Ape* is a source for *Native Son*, and that the issues with which Richard Wright and Eugene O’Neill are concerned share many similarities: racial issues, working-class’ living conditions as well as compassions for the hardship of human beings. Hugo Von Hofmannsthal discovers an analogy between Naguib Mahfouz’s *The Beggar* and *The Hairy Ape*. He thinks that the beggar and Yank are both marginalized people who are “excluded from the ordered world” (9) and cannot find a place where they belong. Wright, O’Neill and Mahfouz’s works all express compassion for the marginalized people and concern for the sentiments of alienation that all human beings experience since the Industrial Revolution. In an interview with Carol Bird, O’Neill says: “I care only for humanity. I wish to arouse compassion. For the unfortunate. The suffering. The oppressed.” (52)

In addition to discussing the protagonist’s sense of not belonging, Hubert Zarf analyzes the Hegelian-Marxist pattern in his “O’Neill’s *Hairy Ape* and the Reversal of Hegelian Dialectics.” He remarks that Yank’s anti-industrial action and his brotherly hug with the gorilla in the final scene shows the impossibility of belonging. Most critics suggest that Yank cannot find a place where he belongs because good living conditions on earth and the existence of heaven are essentially illusions. As the play unfolds, Yank goes on a madman’s journey in search for a solution of the problem of society—capitalist control of labor and commercialization of the society.

## **Heterotopia as a Critique to a Degenerated Utopia**

While some critics focus on Yank’s sense of belonging and his struggles, I intend to bring to bear Michel Foucault’s concept of utopia and heterotopia on Yank’s transgression and his critique of bourgeois society. In this light, the commercialized bourgeois space is a realized utopia whereas the cage on the ship, the prison, and the zoo are heterotopias, which serve as a critique of degenerated utopian society. Before looking at Yank’s transgression, let me return to the scene where Yank encounters Mildred. They are enclosed respectively within spaces of proletariat and bourgeoisie before each serves as a lure that entices the other to cross the border.

Foucault’s concept of utopia and heterotopia is useful to interpret this crossing. For Foucault, utopia is a conceptual space encoded with unconscious desires that can never be fulfilled. Any utopia that can be realized is ideologically formulated. Contrary to utopia, heterotopia is a real space that is opposed to a manifested utopia. He states: “The mirror is, after all, a utopia, since it is a placeless place” (24). Heterotopia, by contrast, is a mirror that reflects reality, and even questions and criticizes it. This makes the cage on the ship a heterotopia, which serves as a critique of commercialized society, a realized utopia governed by bourgeois ideology.

Before looking further into the heterotopic cage, let me first point out the realized utopia in the play. In Act V Yank finally reaches New York, one of the most prosperous cities of the twentieth century, to which Mildred belongs. Through Yank’s eyes, we observe features of modernity in New York, reminiscent of Walter Benjamin’s nineteenth-century Paris: a society of commodified, dehumanized time and spectacle, a utopia turned upside down. The Bessemer process best exemplifies Yank’s subjection to the administration of time, as he cries out: “Speed, dat’s her middle name” (3.161)! In addition to being subjected to the administration of time, human beings are also commodified in an economy that only counts exchange value. As Long exclaims against capitalists, “What right ’as they got to be exhibitin’ us ’s if we was bleeding monkeys in a menagerie? Did we sign for hinsults to our dignity as ’onest workers? ....’Er old man’s [Mildred’s father] a bleedin’ millionaire, a bloody Capitalist! .... And she gives ’er orders as ’ow she wants to see the bloody animals below decks and down they takes ’er” (3.167)! Long observes the secret of a capitalist’s utopia, that is, commodification of everything, even of human beings. And the working class is depicted as animals to be observed, usurped, and framed into the gaze of the wealthy class.

At the corner of Fifth Avenue, Yank the stranger of the metropolis experiences cultural shocks in a commercialized space: “In the rear, the show windows of two shops, a jewellery establishment on the corner, a furrier’s next to it....Rich furs of all varieties hang there bathed in a downpour of artificial light” (5. 173). As the play progresses, Yank is not only disillusioned, but also taken as a caged animal, whose “furs” are to be circulated in the market. As if trying to ward off the artificial quality of the capitalist constructed space, he keeps making claims to his “natural” skin colors, and seems to be proud of his nakedness and his coal dust make-up. By contrast to Yank’s confinement in the cage and in the zoo, ironically the wealthy class is institutionalized and disciplined in the Church and confined in Protestant values: work more and you will get salvation. They are rendered “A procession of gaudy marionettes, yet with something of the relentless horror of Franksteins in

their detached, mechanical unawareness” (5.177). Benjamin explains that this mechanization and dehumanization of individuals into a collective automatic machine is the ideological counterpart of the industrial process where “workers learn to coordinate their own ‘movements to the uniform and unceasing motion of an automation” (133). In other words, in a degenerated utopia, spiritual wealth is sacrificed to economic and industrial progress.

The analysis of a degenerated utopia conveys to us that Yank’s class solidarity is crushed by the aspects of modernity that subject all beings to the laws of commodity and the ideology of “speed,” that is, by the bourgeois administration of time in the service of efficiency. Contrary to the bourgeois society with which the “white” visitor Mildred identifies is the stokehole that displays exploitation of laborers. The ship simply cannot move without stokers exhausting themselves to keep up with the speed of the ship. Here the stokehole is the reverse of utopia, serving as a critical mirror to Mildred’s capitalist society. In addition to heterotopia’s function as a mirror to the established utopia, heterotopia is also a structure of confinement because of its systemic exclusion from the realized utopia. Thus the stokehole is not only a confinement of white immigrant laborers but also a mirror-text to the mythic narrative of the bourgeois utopia.

Foucault remarks in his “Of Other Spaces” that a boat is a heterotopia because it “is a floating piece of space, a place without a place, that exists by itself, that is closed in on itself and at the same time is given over to the infinity of the sea ..., the greatest instrument of economic development..., but has been simultaneously the greatest reserve of the imagination” (27). Yank’s stokehole is located on a ship, which is an other space that is not of the white capitalist world, but a space that confines the madman, whose labor is used to provide economic progress. The structure of the cage confines the body of a collective labor, which carries certain traits of madness and bestiality. As depicted in Act I: “The room is crowded with men, shouting, cursing, laughing, singing—a confused, inchoate uproar swelling into a sort of unity, a meaning—the bewildered, furious, baffled defiance of a beast in a cage” (1.141; emphasis mine). The bestiality is the obverse of the dehumanization in the commodified world, in which the Dionysian spirit is repressed by the Apollonian spirit in order to achieve the progress of a civilization. Their bestiality thus can be related to disruptive madness that a society governed by ultimate reason has to administer. As a result, the structure of the room symbolizes bourgeois ideology that carves their bodies and inscribes their minds. “Rivulets of sooty sweat have traced maps on their backs” (3.161). This explains why Yank tries to think, but does not succeed. “The effect sought after is a cramped space in the bowels of a ship, imprisoned by white steel....The

ceiling crushes down upon the men’s heads. They cannot stand upright. This accentuates the natural stooping posture which shovelling coal and the resultant over-development of back and shoulder muscles have given them” (1.141; emphasis mine). The white ideology not only confines their body and mind but also disciplines their labor into a unity of body and machine on the ship where “there is order in it, rhythm, a mechanical regulated recurrence, a tempo” (3.160). Thus the immigrant laborers’ mind is disciplined by the structure of the confinement on bodies. Rather than the Cartesian subject’s rationality--I think therefore I am—there can be no thinking at all.

The control of labor not only disciplines workers’ minds, but also provides the economic prosperity of the state, in other words, the base supplies for the superstructure. As the play proceeds, Yank’s solidarity put to the test among various institutions. In Act One, he holds on to the solidarity of manpower. When Mildred evokes an uncanny feeling towards Yank, he tries to confront it and traces it back to where it or the Other comes from. In seeing the dehumanization, commodification, and bureaucratization of the metropolis, he determines to destroy the city in protest to it. His attempt is brave, but to no avail: he is first put in prison, then in the zoo, and lastly to death. At the end of the play we witness that his subjectivity is not defined by his physical power; rather, it is shaped by the institutions. Nevertheless, his search for subjectivity and his challenge of the institutions transgresses various confinements of life. His death is the ultimate transgression, an act of not given in to a dehumanized society, and a protest for a living confinement. Yank’s Nietzschean will-to-transgression shapes him as a madman who speaks the truth nobody wants to hear. Quarantined as an animal in the zoo, he is a threat society buries rather than deals with. The play’s audience, though, might turn their gaze onto the society itself.

## Subjection and Subversion of Discourses

Yank transgresses the confinement of bourgeois ideology by venturing out of the enclosure on the ship. Without his Dionysian force, western culture will be the bourgeoisie’s phantasmagoria but the working class’s nightmare. The system of confinement at work in *The Hairy Ape* will be seen in *The Crucible* (1953) in the form of McCarthyism, a prevalent theme of the 1950s in American theatre and history. They both unveil the dominant power’s utopian desires and their opponents’ traumatic experiences. Yank transgresses the confinement of prison, zoo, and existential inertia; the protagonist of *The Crucible*, John Proctor, resists to death the dominant social power in Salem.

Critics tend to focus on female characters in the play and I certainly do not underestimate the feminist yearning for power, but my focus will be on the dominant power’s

violent judicial subjection on a larger social scale. As recounted by the narrator: "...for good purposes, even high purposes, the people of Salem developed a theocracy, a combine of state and religious power whose function was to keep the community together, and to prevent any kind of disunity that might open to destruction by material or ideological enemies. It was forged for a necessary purpose and accomplished that purpose" (1. 6). By probing into the utopian desire of Salem, we will discover that it is their "Land-lust" (1.7) that triggers a series of divisions, inquisitions, and exclusions. Their aim is not to know the truth of witchcraft, but to exclude the deviant from the utopia. We witness how the utopian desire provokes those in power to charge the innocent by imposing the judicial system's "order of discourse" on their behaviors. The suspects, therefore, are executed based not on legal laws but on vengeance.

I take Salem as a degenerated utopian society based on Puritan doctrines in which witchcraft is a demonic as well as transgressive force. In *The Crucible* religious doctrine serves as myth that neutralizes two antagonistic societies. In time of crisis, those in power establish judicial measures not so much to find neither justice nor truth, but to eliminate subversion. This neutralization process can be analyzed, with Foucault, in terms of subjection of discourse through judicial inquisition and exclusion of the deviant—witches. The subjection of discourse makes clear how history is being written and edited among networks of power.

In his "The Discourse on Language," Foucault writes: What is 'writing' (that of 'writers') if not a similar form of subjection, perhaps taking rather different forms, but whose main stresses are nonetheless analogous? May we not also say that the judicial system, as well as institutionalized medicine, constitute similar systems for the subjection of discourse"? (227; emphasis mine)

Foucault further notes that "in every society the production of discourse is at once controlled, selected, organized and redistributed according to a certain number of procedures, whose role is to avert its powers and its dangers, to cope with chance events, to evade its ponderous, awesome materiality" (216). If History is a complete project and discourse is the dominant power's operational plot, then the violence is only detectable between the gap of the norm and the deviant. According to Foucault, will-to-truth is the most pervasive and dominant form of exclusion that has "been attempting to assimilate the others in order both to modify them and to provide them with a firm foundation" (219). In the play, Hale's inquisition to Proctor's belief is conducted based on an order of discourse that leaves the subject no other chance to defend himself but to be subjected by the discourse itself.



Photo by Dave Pape (Creative Commons)

Proctor becomes the prey of judicial violence because he stops going to Church. Rather than losing his belief in God, it is Reverend Parris's preaching of materialism that weakens his faith. He is an avid churchgoer until "Parris came, and for twenty week he preach [sic] nothin' but golden candlesticks until he had them" (2.62). Given Parris's worship of gold, a just investigator would shift his subject of interrogation from Proctor to Parris; nevertheless, as an instrument of judicial discourse, Hale carries on questioning Proctor. Hence, the Inquisition is not based on will to truth, but truth as an established Order inscribed in the discourse. The inquisition seeks deviation from norm, not truth. Hale proceeds to ask Proctor's wife: "Then, with the voice of one administering a secret test: Do you know your Commandments, Elizabeth" (2.63)? This question is coded with the message that your belief in God is decided upon your memory of the Commandments. When Proctor is asked the same question, he cannot ace the secret test and goes on to interrogate Hale's purpose of this inquisition. As a representative of the Church and the Court, and vested with the power of interpreting God and the law, Hale replies: "Theology, sir, is a fortress; no crack in a fortress may be accounted small" (2.64) In other words, there is no deviation allowed and every deviation has to be managed by judicial Order. After Proctor's failure to provide the correct code for the first interrogation, "Hale only looks at Proctor, deep in his attempt to define this man" (2.64). Does he belong to

the Old Salemites or its antagonist? At this stage, although the inquisition is not conducted at court, he is already being branded with the mark of the convicted. The invisible marking on the suspect can be taken as a form of punishment, as Foucault argues in his "The Spectacle of the Scaffold" that "The right to punish, therefore, is an aspect of the sovereign's right to make war on his enemies..." (48). The inquisition then is not a means of seeking truth, but a means of punishment that "reign[s] the active forces of revenge" (48).

Besides reducing will-to-truth to order of discourse, Hale's inquisition adds to, interprets, and edits speech, which suggests his power to overwrite Proctor's statements. As Hale remarks: "I do not judge you. My duty is to add what I may to the godly wisdom of the court" (2. 64). Since only those in power have the right to speak, Proctor's speech, no matter how truthful, will be ignored, silenced, erased, or defined as lies. When Proctor tells him that those who have confessed do it to avoid death, Hale hesitates, but resists penetrating the truth. In Hale's following question he fulfils his part in the dominant power's plot to set up the innocent suspect into the convict. It is apparently a rhetorical question that aims to link up Proctor's relation with witches: "It's said you hold no belief that there may even be witches in the world. Is that true, sir" (2.66)? This is a trick question since positive statement proves that Proctor disbelieves God (because witches testify God's power), and negative statement suggests his alliance with witches. This question also maps out Proctor's stand in political sects, since Salem is governed by theocracy, so an issue regarding religion is political.

Since the first inquisition has convicted him as pagan, later in the day the Old Salemites transcribe their utopian desires into a needle-in-the-poppet plot and stage in Proctor's house. Proctor's faith is shattered when he realizes that religious doctrines and judicial procedures are subjections of discourse that intend to exclude him—a potential threat to the dominant discourse. In the following we will witness how he subverts the order of discourse. Proctor's act of "ripping the warrant" (2.72) transgresses subjection of discourse and reveals the naked truth in Salem. He cries out: "Is the accuser always holy now? Were they born this morning as clean as God's fingers? I'll tell you what's walking Salem—vengeance is walking Salem. [It is the] common vengeance [that] writes the law! This warrant's vengeance" (2.73). Is not the written warrant a symbol of violation that is found in every culture? Are not our civilization and history built upon and written by the myth of the state as enforced in Salem and in O'Neill's metropolis? The secret of utopia is voiced out by Proctor: "And now, half to himself, staring, and turning to the open door: Peace. It is a providence, and no great change; we are only what we always were, but naked now" (2.76). His message alludes to that every peaceful state is under the administration of

the dominant power while closing up or orchestrating the disorder into order. In the case of Salem, the discrepancies between discourses of accusers and the accused, the signs of witchcraft activity and the meaning of the suspects' statement are closed up by Deputy Governor's signature in written form, as in "sealed," which grants him the power to prosecute them: "And do you know that near to four hundred are in the jails from Marblehead to Lynn, and upon my signature" (3.81)? Served as the same purpose as the warrant of the court, Deputy Governor's signature is also the means of judicial violence, which is "letters de cachet and arbitrary measures of imprisonment" (38) as Foucault pointed out in "The Great Confinement."

If inquisition manifests the violence of the judicial procedure, confession completes this violation. As Foucault further remarks in "The Spectacle of the Scaffold," "the confession had priority over any other kind of evidence [because the act of confession means] the accused accepted the charge and recognized its truth [and through which] the accused himself took part in the ritual of producing penal truth" (38). Even though Foucault considers the confession as an accomplice of judicial violence, he nevertheless argues for the production of power in the suspect's speech. This reversal of power is exemplified in Proctor's confession. He confesses his adultery with Abigail to charge her as a whore, using the only thing he has left—speech. "...I lusted, and there is a promise in such sweat. But it is a whore's vengeance, and you must see it..." (3.102). By discoursing back to the law, Proctor opens up the closure sealed by the signature, and reveals how Abigail manipulates the others to take her as a saint.

He implies that a saint is the one who accuses the other so that he or she can protect him or herself from being identified as devil. "I cannot mount the gibbet like a saint. It is a fraud" (4. 126). If he is not a saint, what is he? What does a speaking subject do in a society that subjugates his act and his speech that defines himself as a social being? "...what is John Proctor? He moves as an animal, and a fury is riding in him, a tantalized search....I am no saint" (4. 127). Proctor's question is not only for him, but also for the society, and for all human being: What is the significance of Proctor's position in the society? Why is Proctor censored by the law? The reason might be that he poses as a threat to the dominant discourse. After he confesses verbally, he is asked to sign the confession. In addition to making example out of Proctor and laying down the law, the act of signing makes the confessor an embodiment of truth. Proctor understands the connotation of the signature and finally strives to destroy it. "Proctor tears the paper and crumples it" (4. 133). This act subverts the judicial discourse and opens the closure of written violence repetitively perpetrated in our history. At the end of the play, Proctor sacrifices his own life for that of others.

Hale's judgment on Proctor's act conveys to us that he is analogous to Satan, whose ultimate sin is his pride that bids defiance to God's will. "It is pride, it is vanity" (4. 134). What we see in Proctor's satanic forces is also embodied by Nietzsche and Yank, whose Dionysian spirit and knowledge, though forbidden, will find ways to articulate itself. By rewriting the Salem witch trial, Miller implies that this pattern is to be observed in the opposition between Communists and capitalists. He states: "...while there were no witches, there are

Communists and capitalists now, and in each camp there is certain proof that spies of each side are at work undermining the other" (1. 33). Inasmuch as Yank's death subverts a capitalist space incessantly silencing his voice, Proctor's defiance to the court's Order and God's will transgresses theocracy and strive to give voice to truth.

Full references can be found in the Table of References Section.



Photo by Dave Pape (Creative Commons)

# Table of References

Samantha May, University of the Ryukyus, Japan - *Practicing Peace: The International Okinawan Martial Arts Community as a Community of Practice*

Brown, D., & Leledaki, a. (2010). Eastern movement forms as body-self transforming cultural practices in the west: Towards a sociological perspective. *Cultural Sociology*, 4(1), 123–154. doi:10.1177/1749975509356866

Dalton-Puffer, C., Nikula, T., & Smit, U. (2010). CLIL and Immersion classrooms: Applied linguistic perspectives, *International Journal Of Applied Linguistics*, 20(3), 432-433.

de Guevara, G. & B. (2014). Cosmopolitanism and the culture of peacebuilding, *Review of International Studies*, Available on CJO 2014 doi:10.1017/S026021051300051X

Govreen, Y. R. (2014). “Island of Peace, Island of Bases: American Bases amid the Okinawan Population”, oral presentation.

Höglund, K. & Söderberg, M. K. (2010). Beyond the absence of war: the diversity of peace in post-settlement societies. *Review of International Studies*, 36, pp 367-390. doi:10.1017/S0260210510000069.

Ibadi, Shirin. Share the World's Resources. (2007). The meaning of peace in the 21st century. Available from <http://whww.stwr.org/the-un-people-politics/the-meaning-of-peace-in-the-21st-century.html>

International Okinawa Goju-Ryu Karate-Do Federation Website. (2014). [Online] Available from <http://www.iogkf.com/country-listing.html> [Accessed June 26, 2014].

Juster, J.-C. (2011). *L'identité d'Okinawa à travers les danses et les arts martiaux: Etude ethnologique de la coporéité à partir des rapports entre les danses d'Okinawa et le karate et les kobudô*. Saarbrücken: Editions Universitaires Européennes.

Lakes, K. D., & Hoyt, W. T. (2004). Promoting self-regulation through school-based martial arts training. *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology*, 25(3), 283–302. doi:10.1016/j.appdev.2004.04.002

May, S. (2012). *Canadian Martial Artists and Travel to and from Okinawa: Identity as a learning practice*. (Unpublished master's thesis). Nishihara, University of the Ryukyus.

Nosanchuk, T. A. (1981). The Way of the warrior: The effects of traditional martial arts training on aggressiveness. *Human Relations*, 34(6), 435–444. doi:10.1177/001872678103400601

Okinawa Prefecture Website. (2014). [Online] Available from <http://www.okinawastory.jp/en/why/culture/karate.html> [Accessed June 26, 2014].

Rao, S. (2008). “Oos sensei! Oos sempai! ”: a karate school and lessons on inclusion. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 12(3), 281–299. doi:10.1080/13603110601103238

Sabrina Carpenter (Producer). (2010). "Crazy Train" by Ozzy Osbourne~ Sabrina Carpenter Cover [Video file]. Retrieved from <http://youtu.be/mr4M-RTftiA>

Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism*. London: Vintage.

Troyer, J. A. (2011). Level of consciousness: Reframing our understanding of individual differences in learning. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 12, 290–299. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.02.038

Trulson, M. E. (1986). Martial arts training: A novel “cure” for juvenile delinquency. *Human Relations*, 39(12), 1131–1140. doi:10.1177/001872678603901204

Twemlow, S., & Sacco, F. (1998). The application of traditional martial arts practice and theory to the treatment of violent adolescents. *Adolescence*, 33(131).

United Nations (1995). Declaration on the Occasion of the Fiftieth Anniversary of the United Nations. Retrieved from <http://www.un.org/UN50/dec.htm>

United Nations (2013, March 12). Protection of minority languages is a human rights obligation, UN expert says. The UN News Centre. Retrieved from <http://www.un.org/apps/news>.

Wenger, E. (2000). Communities of practice and social learning systems. *Organization*.7(2). 225-246. doi: 10.1177/135050840072002

**Roberto Bertoni, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland - *Aspects of Italian Buddhist Presence and Poetry***

Almond, P.C. (1988, 2006) *The British Discovery of Buddhism*. Cambridge University Press.

Batchelor, S. (1994) *The Awakening of the West: The Encounter of Buddhism and Western Culture*. Berkeley: Parallax Press.

- Baumann, M. and Prebish C.S. (ed.) (2002) Introduction: Paying Homage to the Buddha in the West, in *Western Dharma: Buddhism beyond Asia*. London, Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, pp. 1-13.
- Baumann, M. Modernist Interpretations of Buddhism in Europe, IN MacMahan, D.L. (ed.) (2012) *Buddhism in the Modern World*, London and New York: Routledge, pp. 113-36.
- Bauman, Z. (2000) *Liquid Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Beck, U. (2009) *Il dio personale. La nascita del dio secolare*. Roma-Bari: Laterza.
- Bertoni, R. ed. (2012) *Aspetti del rapporto tra Buddhismo e cultura in Italia*. Dublin: Trinity College and Turin: Trauben. Available at: [http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587\\_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf](http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf) [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Bertoni, R. (2006) Mitomodernismo: a poetics of art and action, IN Ó Cuilleain, C., Salvadori, C., and Scattergood, J. (eds) *Italian Culture: Interactions, Transpositions, Translations*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, pp. 234-50. Available at: [http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587\\_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf](http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf) [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Bloom, H. (1997) *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry*. Oxford University Press.
- Bonecchi, A. (1992) *Psicologia e Buddhismo*. Milan: Tranchida.
- Bryant, L. (29-10-2002) Buddhism in France is Booming. UPI. Available at: [http://www.upi.com/Odd\\_News/2002/10/29/Feature-Buddhism-in-France-is-booming/UPI-55111035923738/](http://www.upi.com/Odd_News/2002/10/29/Feature-Buddhism-in-France-is-booming/UPI-55111035923738/) [Accessed 27-6-2014].
- Candiani, C.L. (2005) *Io con vestito leggero*. Pasion di Prato (Udine): Campanotto.
- Candiani, C.L. (2014, 1) *La bambina pugile, ovvero la precisione dell'amore*. Turin: Einaudi.
- Candiani, C.L. (2014, 2) *Intervista a Livia Candiani* (by C. Andreoli). Available at: <http://buddismoeoccidente.wordpress.com/interviste/intervista-a-livia-candiani/> [Accessed 27-6-2014].
- Carifi, R. *Tibet* (2011). Florence: Le Lettere.
- European Buddhist Union (2013). Available at: <http://www.e-b-u.org> [Accessed 27-6-2014].
- Faure, B. (2010) *Le Bouddhisme*. Paris: Le Cavalier Bleu.
- Franzoni, A. (1998, reprinted 2001) *Trasformare le emozioni in saggezza secondo il Buddhismo tibetano*. Turin: Promolibri Magnanelli.
- Fromm, E., De Martino, R., and Suzuki, D.T. (1960) *Zen Buddhism and Psychoanalysis*. London: Allen and Unwin.
- Gyatso, T. (1999, reprinted 2002) *Ancient Wisdom, Modern World: Ethics for the New Millennium*. London: Abacus.
- Gyatso, T. (2012) I cristiani comprendono lo spirito buddhista (Interview by De Michellis, D.), "La Stampa" 11-4-2012. Available at: <http://vaticaninsider.lastampa.it/homepage/news/dettaglio-articolo/articolo/dalai-lama-india-religioni-religion-14198/> [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Buddhismo in Italia. Available at: [http://www.cesnur.org/religioni\\_italia/buddhismo.htm](http://www.cesnur.org/religioni_italia/buddhismo.htm) [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- King, S.B. (1996) *Socially Engaged Buddhism*. State University of New York Press.
- Kraidy, M.M. (2005) *Hybridity, or the Cultural Logic of Globalization*. Philadelphia: Temple University
- Jung, C.G. (2003) *La saggezza orientale* (essays originally published in German from 1935 to 1955), Turin: Bollati Boringhieri.
- Jung, C.G. (2004), 1958 Introduction to the 1916 essay *La funzione trascendente*, in *Opere*, vol. VIII. *La dinamica dell'inconscio*, Turin: Bollati Boringhieri.
- Kornfield, J. (2008) *The Wise Heart: A Guide to the Universal Teachings of Buddhist Psychology*. French Transl. (2011) *Bouddha mode d'emploi*, Paris: Belfond.
- Moacanin, R. (1986) *Jung's Psychology and Tibetan Buddhism*, Ilford (Essex, UK): Wisdom.
- Niccolai, G. (1999-2001) *Tre meditazioni*. Available at: <http://rebstein.wordpress.com/2010/03/19/meditazioni/> [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Niccolai, G. (2001) *Esoterico biliardo*. Milan: Archinto.
- Niccolai, G. (2012) *Frisbees della vecchiaia*. Pasion di Prato (Udine): Campanotto.
- Obadia, L. (2009) *Il Buddhismo in Occidente*. Bologna: Il Mulino.



- Pasqualotto, G. (2012) Il Buddhismo nella cultura italiana: Da Marco Polo a Giuseppe Tucci, IN Bertoni, R. (ed.) *Aspetti del rapporto tra Buddhismo e cultura in Italia*. Dublin: Trinity College and Turin: Trauben, pp. 31-70. Available at: [http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587\\_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf](http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf) [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Said, E.W. (1978) *Orientalism*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Sorokin, P.A. (1937) *Social and Cultural Dynamics*. New York: American Book Company.
- Stortini, P. (2012) La presenza del Buddhismo in Italia: La storia e il presente, IN Bertoni, R. (ed.) *Aspetti del rapporto tra Buddhismo e cultura in Italia*. Dublin: Trinity College and Turin: Trauben, pp. 71-102. Available at: [http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587\\_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf](http://media.wix.com/ugd/460587_1310a65df36146139c1d3836239c95e.pdf) [Accessed 28-6-2014].
- Ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi (2009) Socially Engaged Buddhism and the Trajectory of Buddhist Ethical Consciousness. *Religion East and West*, 9, pp.1-23.
- Weber, M. (original German essay 1905; English Transl. 2011) *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Oxford University Press.
- Weber, M. (Original German Essay 1918; English Transl. 1946) Science as a vocation, IN Gerth, H.H. and Wright Mills, C. (eds) *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*, Oxford University Press, pp. 129-156.
- Weber, M. (Original German Essay 1922; French Transl. 2003) *Hindouisme et Bouddhisme*. Paris: Flammarion
- Michaela Weiss, Silesian University, Opava, Czech Republic - Jeanette Winterson's Stone Gods as Trans-world and Trans-gender Dystopia**
- Alway, Joan. 1995. *Critical Theory and Political Possibilities: Conceptions of Emancipatory Politics in the Works of Horkheimer, Adorno, Marcuse, and Habermas*. Westport: Greenwood Press.
- De Beauvoir, Simone. 1949. *The Second Sex*.
- Gordin, Michael D., Helen Tilley, and Gyan Prakash, eds. 2010. "Utopia and Dystopia beyond Space and Time." *Utopia/Dystopia: Conditions of Historical Possibility*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Habermas Jürgen. 1973. *Theory and Practice. Theory and Practice*. Translated by John Viertel. Boston: Beacon.
- Horkheimer Max, and Theodor W. Adorno. 1972. *Dialectic of Enlightenment*. Translated by John Cumming. New York: Continuum.
- Melzer, Patricia. 2006. *Alien Constructions*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Winterson, Jeanette. 2007. *The Stone Gods*. London: Penguin Books.
- Wittig, Monique. 2003. "One is not Born a Woman." In *Feminist Theory Reader: Local and Global Perspectives Reader*, eds. Carole Ruth McCann and Seung-Kyung Kim. 249-254. London: Routledge.
- Emma Nicoletti, University of Western Australia - Becoming-other to Belong: Radical Eco-Cosmopolitanism in Jeff Noon's Nymphomation**
- Cochrane, A., Peck, J. & Tickell, A., 2002. Olympic Dreams: Visions of Partnership. In *City of Revolution: Restructuring Manchester*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, pp. 95-115.
- Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F., 1987. *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, Minneapolis: Minnesota UP.
- Dicken, P., 2002. Global Manchester: From Globaliser to Globalised. In *City of Revolution: Restructuring Manchester*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, pp. 18-33.
- Heise, U.K., 2008. *Sense of Place and Sense of Planet: The Environmental Imagination of the Global*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Noon, J., 2000. *Nymphomation*, London: Black Swan.
- Plumwood, V., 1993. *Feminism and the Mastery of Nature*, London: Routledge.
- Quilley, S., 2002. Entrepreneurial Turns: Municipal Socialism and After. In *City of Revolution: Restructuring Manchester*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, pp. 76-94.
- Hui Chun Li, National Sun Yat-sen University, Taiwan - Confinement and Transgression in Eugene O'Neill's The Hairy Ape and Arthur Miller's The Crucible**
- Ciancio, Ralph A. "Richard Wright, Eugene O'Neill, and 'The Beast in the Skull.'" *Modern Language Studies* 23.3(1993): 45-59.Print.

Foucault, Michel. "The Discourse on Language." *The Archaeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language*. Trans. A. M. Sheridan Smith. New York: Pantheon Books, 1972. 215-37. Print.

---. "The Spectacle of the Scaffold." *Discipline and Punish and The Birth of the Prison*. Trans. Alan Sheridan. New York: Vintage Books, 1977. 32-69. Print.

---. "Of Other Spaces." *Diacritics*. Trans. Jay Miscowiec. 16.1(1986):22-7.

---. "The Great Confinement." *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*. Trans. Richard Howard. New York: Vintage Books, 1988. 38-64. Print.

Hofmannsthal, Hugo Von. "The Beggar and The Hairy Ape (1923)." *Eugene O'Neill's Critics: Voices from Abroad*. Illinois: Southern Illinois U, 1984. 9-10.

Miller, Arthur. *The Crucible*. New York: Penguin Books, 1995. Print.

Montale, Eugenio. "O'Neill and the Future of the Theatre." *Eugene O'Neill's Critics: Voices from Abroad*. Illinois: Southern Illinois U, 1984. 70-3.

O'Neill, Eugene. "The Hairy Ape." *The Emperor Jones; Anna Christie; The Hairy Ape*. New York: Vintage Books, 1972. 137-98. Print.

Zarf, Hubert. "O'Neill's *Hairy Ape* and the Reversal of Hegelian Dialectics." *Modern Drama* 30.1(1988): 35-40.

# **The IAFOR** **Academic Review**

Volume 1 | Issue 5

## **Interdisciplinary Perspectives within Cultural Studies**

Published by The International Academic Forum  
(IAFOR), Japan

IAFOR Publications. Sakae 1-16-26-201, Naka-ward,  
Aichi, Japan 460-0008

IAFOR Publications © Copyright 2015  
ISSN: 2188-9570

Design: Michael Liam Kedzlie and Thaddeus Pope